Catalogue no. 85-561-M, no. 21
ISSN 1707-5203
ISBN 978-1-100-15875-4

Crime and Justice Research Paper Series

Towards the Development of a National Data Collection Framework to Measure Trafficking in Persons

by Lucie Ogrodnik

Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics

Telephone: 1-800-387-2231 Fax: 1-613-951-6615

Statistics Canada Statistique Canada

Canada

How to obtain more information

For information about this product or the wide range of services and data available from Statistics Canada, visit our website at *www.statcan.gc.ca*, e-mail us at *infostats@statcan.gc.ca*, or telephone us, Monday to Friday from 8:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m., at the following numbers:

Statistics Canada's National Contact Centre

Toll-free telephone (Canada and the United States):	
Inquiries line	1-800-263-1136
National telecommunications device for the hearing impaired	1-800-363-7629
Fax line	1-877-287-4369
Local or international calls:	
Inquiries line	1-613-951-8116
Fax line	1-613-951-0581

Depository Services Program

Inquiries line	1-800-635-7943
Fax line	1-800-565-7757

To access this product

This product, Catalogue no. 85-561-M, is available free in electronic format. To obtain a single issue, visit our website at *www.statcan.gc.ca* and browse by "Key resource" > "Publications."

Standards of service to the public

Statistics Canada is committed to serving its clients in a prompt, reliable and courteous manner. To this end, Statistics Canada has developed *standards of service* that its employees observe. To obtain a copy of these service standards, please contact Statistics Canada toll-free at 1-800-263-1136. The service standards are also published on *www.statcan.gc.ca* under "About us" > "Providing services to Canadians."

Statistics Canada
Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics

Towards the Development of a National Data Collection Framework to Measure Trafficking in Persons

Published by authority of the Minister responsible for Statistics Canada

© Minister of Industry, 2010

All rights reserved. The content of this electronic publication may be reproduced, in whole or in part, and by any means, without further permission from Statistics Canada, subject to the following conditions: that it be done solely for the purposes of private study, research, criticism, review or newspaper summary, and/or for non-commercial purposes; and that Statistics Canada be fully acknowledged as follows: Source (or "Adapted from", if appropriate): Statistics Canada, year of publication, name of product, catalogue number, volume and issue numbers, reference period and page(s). Otherwise, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form, by any means—electronic, mechanical or photocopy—or for any purposes without prior written permission of Licensing Services, Client Services Division, Statistics Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1A 0T6.

June 2010

Catalogue no. 85-561-M, no. 21

ISSN 1707-5203
ISBN 978-1-100-15875-4

Frequency: Occasional

Ottawa

Cette publication est également disponible en français.

Note of appreciation

Canada owes the success of its statistical system to a long-standing partnership between Statistics Canada, the citizens of Canada, its businesses, governments and other institutions. Accurate and timely statistical information could not be produced without their continued cooperation and goodwill.

User information

Symbols

The following standard symbols are used in Statistics Canada publications:

.	not available for any reference period
..	not available for a specific reference period
...	not applicable
0	true zero or a value rounded to zero
0s	value rounded to 0 (zero) where there is a meaningful distinction between true zero and the value that was rounded
p	preliminary
r	revised
x	suppressed to meet the confidentiality requirements of the *Statistics Act*
E	use with caution
F	too unreliable to be published

Acknowledgements

This report was prepared by the Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics with the financial support of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada.

The Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics wishes to thank all participants for their valuable input and advice during the consultations on developing a national data collection framework to measure trafficking in persons.

Table of contents

Towards the Development of a National Data Collection Framework to Measure Trafficking in Persons

1	Executive summary	5
2	Background	6
3	Summary of consultations	7
4	Information needs	14
5	Current data holdings	16
6	Indirect indicators	18
7	Challenges	19
8	Conclusion	21
9	Summary	27
10	Bibliography	28

Appendix

I	Key stakeholder consultation list	30
II	International approaches to trafficking in persons data collection	33
III	Consultation summary	38

Towards the Development of a National Data Collection Framework to Measure Trafficking in Persons

by Lucie Ogrodnik

1 Executive summary

While trafficking in persons (TIP) has become a worldwide concern, current data collection activities reveal many shortcomings: data are limited in scope, incomparable and insufficient to ascertain the true extent of the problem in Canada.

This study was undertaken by the Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics (CCJS) and funded by Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) to examine the feasibility of developing a national data collection framework to measure trafficking in persons in Canada. Consultations were undertaken with key stakeholders from provincial and federal government departments including members of the Interdepartmental Working Group on Trafficking in Persons (IWGTIP), the police community, non-government organizations (NGOs) and academics.

The overriding theme throughout the consultations was the lack of comprehensive, reliable and comparable data on human trafficking. The underground nature of trafficking networks, victims' reluctance to report crimes to the authorities, difficulties in identifying victims, and the sensitive nature of the data are all factors that present real challenges for reliable data collection. Furthermore, the minimal information that is available in Canada is dispersed across different departments and agencies within government and other organizations including law enforcement and NGOs each using their own criteria to define a victim of trafficking thus generating non-comparable information. In the absence of reliable, ongoing information to inform the issue, it is unknown whether incidents of human trafficking are increasing or decreasing, and whether the current justice responses are effective, which in turn, renders policy decision-making a challenge.

This report identifies a number of data collection and research strategies that could contribute to a better understanding of the nature and scope of human trafficking in Canada. This is fundamental in assisting Canada to strengthen its responses to this crime in furtherance of its international obligations under the *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children* (hereafter the "*Trafficking Protocol*"). Possible approaches towards improving data collection on trafficking in persons within Canada include: developing consensus on definitions, indicators and concepts; examining the feasibility and implications of enhancing the content of existing CCJS databases; and, addressing specific information gaps through research studies.

This report also examines a range of approaches to the collection of data on human trafficking that have been developed and initiated in a number of European countries and in the United States. The report briefly outlines some examples of these international activities which may provide insights and offer lessons learned for Canada.

2 Background

Trafficking in persons (TIP)[1] involves the recruitment, transportation or harbouring of persons for the purpose of exploitation. At its core, the crime is about the exploitation of another person's labour or services and is a phenomenon that occurs worldwide. Men, women and children can be bought, sold and forced to provide their labour or services in the commercial sex trade, sweatshops, agriculture, domestic service, and other types of servitude. While individual circumstances vary, fraud, coercion or force typically distinguishes trafficking victims from people who are smuggled. Human trafficking can occur internationally where persons are moved from one country to another, as well as domestically within the borders of their own country.

Estimates of global human trafficking have ranged greatly over the years and questions have been raised about the accuracy of these estimates due to the availability, quality, comparability and reliability of the data, as well as difficulties in replicating the numbers. Furthermore, there is considerable discrepancy between the estimated number of victims of human trafficking and the number of victims coming forward. Countries around the world continue to struggle with developing an effective mechanism for counting the number of trafficking cases, the victims and their traffickers.

> "Only by understanding the depth, breadth and scope of the problem can we address.... how to counter it. So far we have not attained much knowledge and therefore initiatives have been inadequate and disjointed. Policy can be effective if it is evidence-based, and so far the evidence has been scant." (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2009).

In recent years, Canada has passed criminal legislation on trafficking in persons. However, similar to other countries worldwide, difficulties remain in assessing the nature and extent of TIP in Canada. Given the limited amount of national data available on trafficking in persons in Canada, in 2007/2008 and 2008/2009 Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) provided funding to the Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics (CCJS) at Statistics Canada to conduct a feasibility study in order to increase understanding of human trafficking in Canada.

Based on interviews with a variety of stakeholders, this report summarizes the current understanding of human trafficking in Canada, including existing data holdings, data needs and information gaps, and identifies possible direct and indirect indicators. The report also presents a description of challenges in relation to the collection and sharing of information, and proposes approaches for consideration that could improve overall data collection at the national level. In addition, a range of international approaches to data collection are presented which may offer insights and lessons learned regarding future direction. Reliable information and data on issues relating to human trafficking are essential tools that will inform and assist policy makers in the decision-making process.

The feasibility study was conducted in two phases: the first phase consisted of consultations with a wide range of participants with expertise and/or familiarity with human trafficking. The list of stakeholders consulted includes federal representatives of the Interdepartmental Working Group on Trafficking in Persons (IWGTIP), representatives from provincial government departments, the police community, non-government organizations and academics (see Appendix I for the list of agencies and organizations that were contacted). In order to gain a more thorough understanding of the data that currently exist in Canada, the second phase of the feasibility study consisted of follow-up consultations with those organizations that, through the first phase of consultations, indicated that they collect data on human trafficking.

The primary purpose of this report is to assess the information that is available within Canada about human trafficking, to highlight what is not known, and to suggest how information gathering could be improved.

1 Throughout this report, trafficking in persons may also be referred to as 'TIP' or 'human trafficking'.

3 Summary of consultations

During March and April 2008, the Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics (CCJS) conducted consultations with key stakeholders in an effort to examine the feasibility of developing a national data collection framework that would identify options for measuring trafficking in persons in Canada.

In developing the list of stakeholders to be consulted, the CCJS included federal government members of the Interdepartmental Working Group on Trafficking in Persons (IWGTIP), representatives from provincial governments, the police community through the Police Information and Statistics Committee (POLIS), RCMP Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre, the Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons in British Columbia, non-government organizations (NGOs), and members of the academic community.

A consultation questionnaire was sent to nearly 90 contacts with an expertise in the area of human trafficking. A total of 35 completed questionnaires were returned to CCJS, including 18 (51%) government representatives, 9 (26%) police agencies, 6 (17%) NGOs, and 2 (6%) academics. Stakeholders were asked to consult with colleagues within their respective departments or organizations and respond to the questions as completely as possible. In those instances where the consultation document was sent to more than one representative within a particular government department, one completed questionnaire was submitted to reflect the position of the department. Broad participation was important to ensure that the results accurately portray the current situation regarding objectives and priorities, data availability, information needs and gaps in our collective knowledge of human trafficking in Canada. The responses received from participants were aggregated and appear in Appendix III. Specific suggestions and comments were incorporated into the document where applicable.

The purpose of phase I of the consultation process was to:

1. Clarify and prioritize the objectives of a possible national data collection framework for human trafficking.

2. Define the:

- scope of human trafficking (e.g., sexual exploitation, labour exploitation, forced removal of human organs and tissues, etc.);
- units of measurement (incident, victim, accused, case);
- level of analysis (domestic, international, level of geography within Canada: national, provincial/territorial, census metropolitan area) to be collected; and,
- victims of human trafficking.

3. Understand the data and information needs of various government departments and organizations related to human trafficking and identify data gaps.

4. Identify the types of data and information that are currently being collected by departments and organizations.

5. Identify potential indicators (both direct and indirect) of human trafficking.

6. Identify the challenges that will need to be addressed regarding data collection and data sharing.

Upon completion of phase I of the consultations, a second round of consultations was conducted with those stakeholders that indicated that their department or organization collects data and/or information about human trafficking (November 2008 to January 2009). Specifically, respondents were asked the following types of questions:

- What type(s) of information is being collected by your organization/ agency?
- How is the information being collected?
- What is the information being used for?
- Could additional information be collected to address identified data gaps?

- Is your organization willing to share your information?
- What difficulties does your organization face when collecting TIP data?
- What obstacles would need to be overcome to facilitate information sharing across departments and organizations?

The following summarizes the results of the consultations and is organized according to the survey questions. The responses highlight the major issues, questions and challenges raised during the consultations.

3.1 Objectives

The stakeholders were provided with a list of five possible objectives for a national data collection strategy for human trafficking and were asked to rank them in order of importance. Based on the consultations, respondents ranked the objectives in the following order:

1. to improve the detection and reporting of human trafficking;
2. to provide information that will enhance the capacity of government, law enforcement and NGO's to make evidence-based decisions;
3. to establish baseline information;
4. to work towards consistent and accurate data collection practices; and,
5. to increase public awareness.

Stakeholders were also asked to state why the objectives were important. The following highlights some of the comments provided:

"It is important to work toward consistent and accurate data collection practices, in order to establish a baseline of information and determine the scope of the TIP problem in Canada. We receive many questionnaires including the US TIP questionnaire, which ask for statistics and we are not able to provide accurate data. Once we have the data, we can then make better policy decisions."

"There is no system of analysis or response. We need a systemic framework of data collection, analysis and policy development. Through establishing a baseline it will be possible to measure outcome of initiatives from the step above."

"It is vital to obtain statistics on the incidence of TIP in Canada, which will impact on our response to the issue."

"For us it is most important to improve the detection and reporting of trafficking so women can receive care and assistance."

Stakeholders also suggested a number of **additional objectives** which focused primarily around victim identification, research and reporting, and responses to human trafficking:

1) victim identification:

- track missing individuals (particularly children) using identification information worldwide;
- facilitate victim identification and information sharing; and,
- distinguish between trafficking for sexual exploitation and trafficking for labour.

2) response to human trafficking:

- establish concrete action;
- improve government responses (e.g. services for victims);
- develop prevention strategies and tracking;
- granting/denial of temporary resident permit (TRP) applications; and,
- capture deportation rates of women according to country.

3) research and reporting:

- provide comprehensive information to Parliament and international organizations;
- help determine penetration of organized crime's involvement with TIP;
- promote links between researchers, policy makers and educational institutions;
- identify risk factors that could prevent and/or reduce TIP;
- develop mechanism for tracking demand;
- provide data for research purposes;
- increase intelligence information;
- develop a database to track/find information on the trafficking of children (under 18); and,
- monitor migrants and refugees in an ongoing and consistent manner.

3.2 Scope of human trafficking

The human trafficking offences defined in the *Criminal Code of Canada* focus on the exploitation of the victim, and as such, can be applied to the various manifestations that this crime can take. The TIP offences apply equally to victims brought into Canada from abroad, victims being transited through Canada to another country, and victims who originate and are exploited within Canada. Respondents were asked whether the data collection framework should focus its collection on one or all of these dimensions.

Participants overwhelmingly responded that the data collection framework should not be solely focused on internationally trafficked persons. Many of the stakeholders identified that to obtain a more accurate picture of the nature and scope of human trafficking in Canada, it is essential to monitor all possible scenarios.

The majority of stakeholders thought that it is essential to collect data on **international** trafficking (97% of stakeholders) as well as **domestic** trafficking (88%).

Three-quarters of respondents reported that it was also essential to collect data on **persons trafficked from Canada** (76%) and trafficked persons that **transit through Canada** en route to another destination (70%).

> "The issue of trafficking is convoluted. In order for the government to apply a holistic and comprehensive paradigm to this issue, data on all forms of trafficking need to be collected, disseminated and collated concurrently and on an on-going basis."

> "It is useful to know whether Canada is primarily a source or destination country and from where trafficking victims originate. As part of our international responsibilities it is important that Canada be able to track and report on the problem of trafficking in persons inside Canada."

3.3 Forms of human trafficking

While the known cases of human trafficking in Canada have predominantly involved forms of sexual exploitation, stakeholders were asked to identify which additional types of human trafficking were important to capture when collecting national data.

There was wide agreement among stakeholders that the **essential** types of trafficking to collect include:

- trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation (100%);
- child sex tourism (82%); and,
- forced labour (78%).

Over one-half to two-thirds of respondents reported that it is important to capture data on the following issues:

- migrant smuggling (66%);
- trafficking for human organs and tissues (62%);
- mail-order brides (56%); and,
- foreign caregivers (53%).

Fewer than half thought that it is important to collect information on:

- foreign adoption (45%) or
- forced begging (32%).

> "Too early/arbitrary to focus only on one type of exploitation and eliminate data collection on others. It is important to gather data on all forms of trafficking in Canada to provide law enforcement authorities and partners with a clear picture of the scope and type of TIP."

It is important to note that while a large proportion of stakeholders identified information on migrant smuggling and child sex tourism as essential to collect, these illegal activities do not necessarily constitute human trafficking. Individuals who may be brought into Canada as mail-order brides or foreign caregivers are also not necessarily victims of trafficking but they may be more vulnerable to being trafficked. These 'forms' of trafficking identified by respondents reflect differences in perspectives of what may or may not constitute trafficking in persons.

TIP is often confused with migrant smuggling which involves the illegal movement of persons across international borders for profit. Smuggled migrants consent to the illegal transaction and unlike trafficking they are generally free to leave once they reach their final destination. It is recognized that in some cases, smuggled migrants may subsequently be subject to exploitation and become trafficked persons. And in the case of child sex tourism, the child who is the victim may have been trafficked, but the individual who engages in tourism for the purposes of engaging in sexual conduct with children may be guilty of other offences but not human trafficking. While there may be linkages between these activities and human trafficking, the activities themselves do not necessarily constitute trafficking.

3.4 Defining victims

In order to understand the phenomenon of human trafficking, the first step is to have a clear and unambiguous definition. As such, stakeholders were asked to identify the point at which a person would be considered a 'victim' or 'survivor' of human trafficking according to their organization.

While a range of responses were provided, there was wide agreement among stakeholders that:

- persons **identified and confirmed** by the authorities should be considered trafficking victims (97%); followed by
- persons **identified by authorities** (89%); and,
- **victims receiving services** (83%).

There was considerably less agreement among the respondents for the remaining possible categories of trafficking victims, which include:

- individuals who **self identify** as victims (69%);
- TIP victims **that declined services** (67%); and,
- **'Suspected'** but not confirmed victims (43%).

"It is difficult to agree on what constitutes a TIP victim."

"A person may be identified as a victim of trafficking for different purposes. In an immigration context, an immigration officer may grant a person a temporary resident permit if the officer 'suspects' that the individual is a victim of trafficking even though no criminal charges have been laid. In the criminal law context, a person may be identified by police as a victim of trafficking when charges are laid against an accused and the offence is only alleged. The threshold may be different than in an immigration context where the guidelines only require that a person be 'suspected' of being a victim."

Another dynamic that may impede the identification of trafficked persons in Canada is that trafficked persons may not see themselves as a victim or a survivor of trafficking. They may not realize that what has happened to them was a criminal offence until much later after having received support and healed from the experience.

The accuracy and consistency of victim identification across the various organizations and departments is central not only to understanding the true extent of the crime, but also to providing timely victim services and support. The consequences of not identifying victims can be considerable in their impact on the course of action taken (e.g., removal from the country, criminalized, re-trafficked) and on the accuracy of data collection.

3.5 Defining human trafficking

As a follow-up question to assess whether stakeholders have the same or equivalent understanding of the issue, respondents were asked whether their organization has a definition for victims of human trafficking.

Results revealed that the respondents are not consistent in how they define human trafficking:

- One-third of respondents indicated that their definition was based on the human trafficking offences in the ***Criminal Code of Canada*** or in conjunction with the definition in the ***Immigration and Refugee Protection Act***.
- One-quarter of stakeholders reported that they **have their own definition** of human trafficking (predominantly NGOs).
- 20% follow the **guidelines contained in the United Nations (UN)** ***Trafficking Protocol***.
- One respondent stated that they **do not have a definition**, and,
- the remaining respondents (5) did not respond to this question.

A number of respondents indicated that their definition follows that of the *Trafficking Protocol*. It is worth noting, however that a "victim of human trafficking" is not explicitly defined in the text of the *Trafficking Protocol*.

U.N. *Trafficking Protocol*

The *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children*, supplementing the *UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, came into force on December 25, 2003. Canada ratified the *Trafficking Protocol* on May 13, 2002. Article 3(a) of the Protocol breaks down the offence of trafficking in persons into three elements that are to be considered jointly:

1. **criminal acts** (recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons);

2. **the means used to commit these acts** (the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power or a position of vulnerability, giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person); and

3. **the purpose, goals or forms of exploitation** (prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs).

Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. It should be noted that the consent of the victim is irrelevant where any of the means identified in the definition have been used. In addition, the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered trafficking in persons even if this does not involve any of the means set forth above. Under the *Trafficking Protocol*, a child is any person under 18 years of age.

As party to the *Trafficking Protocol*, Canada is obligated to enact domestic laws to criminalize human trafficking and also to undertake measures for the prevention of human trafficking and the protection of its victims. Canada's approach has been multi-faceted through supporting the 3 'P's' as outlined in the *Trafficking Protocol*: **prevention**, **protection** and **prosecution**; as well as adding a fourth 'P', that of working in **partnership** with key stakeholders both nationally and internationally.

TIP offences under the *Criminal Code of Canada*

In 2005, three specific offences were added to the *Criminal Code of Canada* to address trafficking in persons (sections 279.01, 279.02, 279.03). Specifically, these new offences prohibit persons from:

- engaging in specified acts for the purpose of exploiting or facilitating the **exploitation of a person**;
- **receiving a financial or other material benefit** resulting from the commission of a TIP offence; and,
- **withholding or destroying of documents,** such as identification or travel documents for the purpose of committing or facilitating the commission of a TIP offence.

In addition, section 279.04 specifies that a person exploits another person if they cause them to provide, or offer to provide, labour or a service by engaging in conduct that could reasonably be expected to cause the other person to believe that their safety or the safety of a person known to them would be threatened if they failed to provide the labour or service. Exploitation is also defined as causing a person, by means of deception, the use or threat of force, or other form of coercion, to have an organ or tissue removed. As well, the offence stipulates that no consent to the activity of trafficking is valid.

Immigration and Refugee Protection Act

In addition to these *Criminal Code* offences, charges related to human trafficking can be laid under the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act* (*IRPA*). The *IRPA* includes a human trafficking offence (section 118); however, it only applies to cases involving transnational trafficking, that is, the trafficking of persons into Canada. The offence carries a maximum penalty of life imprisonment and/or a fine of up to $1 million. This offence came into force in 2002.

Respondents commented that human trafficking is **very difficult to define, and that there is need for a common definition** to prevent "blurring lines" between human trafficking, migrant smuggling, child sex tourism and prostitution. There continues to be a lack of clarity and continued confusion, and in some cases disagreement,

regarding what should and should not to be included under human trafficking. For example, the concept of exploitation within the trafficking offence is very broad, and as such the parameters of what may be considered exploitative to some organizations may include child pornography, child sex tourism, child sexual exploitation and adult prostitution. For the purpose of concise and consistent data collection, understanding the differences between these issues must be clearly understood.

The concept of **domestic trafficking** also may not be clear. For example, 'human trafficking' is being applied to cases of domestic prostitution.

> "In many instances, there is a blurring of lines between the recruitment and grooming of young people into the sex trade, and the geographic movement of sex trade workers from one location or community to another."

> "Difficult to define and measure. Prostitution is difficult to separate out when recruitment is involved, but it needs to be. The policy solutions and approaches are not necessarily the same however."

> "Need to clarify the definitions (e.g. TIP, human smuggling, prostitution, forceful confinement)."

> "An individual who is subjected to labour or sexual exploitation is a victim of human trafficking."

> "The organization's role is not to identify victims but rather to work with the victims, as witnesses, in order to mount an effective human trafficking prosecution."

Confusion regarding the basic definition of human trafficking has implications not only for data collection efforts, but also for victim assistance, criminal justice responses and policy development. The lack of a widely shared common understanding of the basic features of human trafficking is a major impediment to consistent data collection and reporting.

3.6 Level of geography

Respondents were asked about the level of geography that would be important to collect regarding human trafficking. Most stakeholders reported that the collection of human trafficking data only at the national level was insufficient. The overwhelming majority of respondents identified that it is essential to collect detailed statistics at the national level (97%), followed closely by provincial/ territorial breakdowns (91%), and lastly, but still essential to collect is data by census metropolitan area (CMA) (88%).

> "Geographic data is essential in assessing the nature of the problem. This must include city level granularity when possible as these are the ports of entry to the country and will provide key data."

> "Need data collection at all levels so we can be aware of what is happening and provide services to those who have been trafficked. Also we can look at the factors locally (or provincially) that are contributing to the demand for cheap and exploitable labour."

> "To obtain as complete a picture as possible information/stats are necessary from all levels. It is also essential to incorporate preventive measures that include out of the country efforts such as consulates, liaison offices, foreign missions, NATO missions, etc. Source interventions would have a positive effect on domestic human trafficking responses."

> "Any strategy aimed at data collection on TIP must remain seized of the reality that Canada's major urban centres are the largest recipients of new immigrants, and are likely also the parts of the country where TIP is most likely to occur. Organized crime is likely to be a larger consideration in major urban centres, and one might suspect that TIP would also be a larger problem in those centres, making them logical starting points for data collection."

4 Information needs

4.1 Direct indicators

Stakeholders were asked to identify the types of data and information that they require in order to meet their information needs regarding human trafficking. This question was not intended to be a detailed needs assessment exercise, but rather to provide a general overview of the types of information needs.

> "Decisions need to be made around what information is needed, where the data gaps lie and why we need to collect it. This level of understanding is essential before we can build a strategy of how to collect it." (International Organization for Migration, 2007)

Over 80% of respondents indicated that it is **essential to collect**:

- number of incidents of human trafficking (cases);
- type of exploitation (sexual exploitation, forced labour, etc.);
- number of international and domestic incidents;
- number of victims; and,
- victim characteristics.

Between 60% and 70% of respondents identified the following indicators as **important to collect**:

- number of 'suspected' and confirmed incidents
- number of persons accused of TIP
- number of prosecutions
- number of convictions
- citizenship of victims
- accused characteristics
- number of incidents attributed to organized crime
- number of Temporary Resident Permits (TRPs) issued
- characteristics of the incident

The indicators that were ranked as **desirable but not essential** to collect include:

- number of TIP victims that received services
- number of TIP victims that were re-trafficked
- number of repatriated TIP victims and number remaining in Canada
- type of disposition
- sentence length
- types of services received by victims

- impacts/consequences of TIP on victims
- profits generated through TIP

Other types of direct indicators that participants thought may be of interest to collect include:

- health status of victims
- number of TIP victims not identified by the authorities
- number of victims/accused by industry
- forced marriages
- victim ethnicity
- relationship between the accused and the victim
- language spoken by victim
- citizenship of accused
- number of victims wanting to stay in Canada but are not permitted

Based on the consultations, it is proposed that data collection should focus on those indicators that most accurately measure and inform the issue at hand consistently and from year to year. As such, it is also important to limit data collection to a set of **CORE 'need to know' indicators** that will help address the two main objectives of the data collection exercise: (1) to improve the detection and reporting of human trafficking, and (2) to provide information that will enhance the capacity of government, law enforcement and NGOs to make evidence-based decisions. Peripheral 'would like to know' items may not be essential to collect. These could be collected through other means, such as qualitative research studies.

4.2 Information and data gaps

Stakeholders revealed that there is a clear need to gain a better understanding of the extent and nature of trafficking in persons in Canada. Respondents were asked to identify the types of specific questions their organization would like answered concerning human trafficking. A wide array of information needs were identified ranging from the most basic baseline information on the incidence of trafficking in Canada, to additional details about the characteristics of adult and child victims, persons accused of trafficking, as well as the demand side of human trafficking.

Specifically, respondents identified seven **major areas where information is currently lacking**:

1. ongoing data collection
2. basic information to inform TIP
3. victim information
4. criminal justice response to TIP
5. demand side of TIP
6. lack of information sharing and improve communication
7. creation and maintenance of a national database

1. The primary data gap mentioned by respondents relates to the **need for ongoing, consistent and comprehensive data collection.** Many respondents commented on the general lack of data on human trafficking.

> "The gaps are cavernous. We are unfamiliar with anything approaching a workable common understanding of trafficking, let alone a coherent data set on victims, offences, incidents etc."

> "There is not a system in place to measure the number of investigations, prosecutions, and convictions. We also need better information on victims of trafficking, source regions, destinations and links with organized crime. We also need to know what type of exploitation is occurring (forced labour, sexual exploitation)."

2. Secondly, respondents repeatedly pointed out the **lack of the most basic information** on human trafficking, such as the number of persons trafficked to assess whether or not it is a problem in Canada. Other basic information needs include: the number of victims; the different types of human trafficking; a need to distinguish between international and domestic trafficking; the involvement of organized crime; how money generated through human trafficking is used; variations in human trafficking across the provinces and Canadian cities; profile of the typical offender; and, the number of traffickers charged and prosecuted.

3. Thirdly, it was expressed that **more information on victims** is required, specifically: who are the victims of trafficking and what is the profile of a typical victim of TIP; how many children are victims of trafficking; how victims are identified; the extent of Aboriginal people trafficked within Canada; and, the circumstances that lead to victims being trafficked.

4. Fourthly, there is a need to better understand the **criminal justice responses** to trafficking. Respondents pointed out that they need to know: what is being done by other agencies to detect and deter human trafficking; techniques that lead to successful prosecution or interventions; what is being done by other enforcement agencies to gain compliance of suspected and confirmed victims; the number of temporary resident permits (TRPs) issued and denied; the types of services that victims require; the first point of contact with victims (ports of entry, police raids); and, the role of NGOs in assisting anti-TIP initiatives.

5. Respondents also need to know more about the **demand side** of the equation. Specifically, how the local sex industry contributes to trafficking both internationally and domestically, and how the demand for cheap labour is tied to human trafficking.

6. Next, respondents noted the **lack of information sharing** and the **need to improve communication**. Specifically, there is a need to strengthen relationships and promote sharing of information between the federal organizations and their provincial/territorial counterparts in their respective anti-trafficking efforts, as well as between governments and NGOs.

7. Lastly, respondents had questions about **how to manage the data** that are currently dispersed across many different organizations and departments with neither definitional standards nor sharing mechanisms in place and the feasibility of centralizing the data. Specifically, stakeholders wondered: which organization(s) would have access to the data; whose responsibility would it be to maintain and manage the database; concerns about the security and confidentiality of databases housing human trafficking data; who will provide training for usage of the database; and, whether the information collected could be used for public awareness and education.

5 Current data holdings

Part of this study was to examine current data holdings to determine and assess the capacity to respond to the information needs identified through this consultation process.

Over half (56%) of stakeholders indicated that they collect some data or qualitative information on human trafficking. However, there is a wide array of information collected including the number of victims and services received, data collected through official police files, number of investigations, temporary resident permits issued, number of cases prosecuted, and research projects. The list below identifies the organizations and departments that currently collect either data or information on human trafficking, and a short description of their data holdings.

Agencies that collect information on human trafficking:

(a) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre
Collects data on all investigations on human trafficking including: names and personal information on all alleged victims, suspects and witnesses; details of the allegation including location of the offence, location of where a victim was recruited from, other offences that may be associated with the offence.

(b) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, National Crime Prevention Services Branch
Collect data through the Royal Canadian Mounted Police's Police Reporting and Occurrence System.

(c) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Human Trafficking Awareness Coordinator "O" Division
Official statistics are collected when the files are scored as human trafficking. The Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre keeps detailed records of all trafficking in persons cases brought to their attention.

(d) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, National Missing Children Services
Closely monitors its missing children cases for indications of domestic and international trafficking of children.

(e) Vancouver Police, Vice Unit
Collects data through police files (e.g., living off the avails of prostitution, keeping a common bawdy house).

(f) Canada Border Services Agency, Anti-Fraud and Human Trafficking
Collects intelligence and compiles intelligence reports on suspected human smuggling and potential trafficking victims and traffickers. Also collects intelligence on the circumstances which lead the Canada Border Services Agency to believe that trafficking is taking place.

(g) Citizenship and Immigration Canada
Information is compiled within the region and office dealing with the case. For example, was a Temporary Resident Permit issued, if yes, date and duration; is this a subsequent permit; client ID number; minor; country of citizenship; work permit issued; third party involvement; gender; summary of the case; and Temporary Resident Permit decision. Information is populated manually after it is received from officers processing cases in the field.

(h) Justice Canada, Criminal Law Policy Section
Review of reported and unreported court decisions and information provided directly by law enforcement.

(i) Statistics Canada, Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics
Official police-reported data, court and corrections data based on *Criminal Code* and other federal statute offences.

(j) Financial Transactions Reports Analysis Centre of Canada
Collects data via Section 54 of the Proceeds of Crime (money laundering) and Terrorist Financing Acts.

(k) Public Prosecution Service of Canada, Headquarters Counsel Group
Collects the number of trafficking in persons cases prosecuted by Public Prosecution Service of Canada.

(l) Alberta Solicitor General and Public Security, Victim Services Branch
Compiles statistics sent to them from their funded victim service programs.

(m) Université de Montréal, Interdisciplinary Research Centre on Family Violence and Violence against Women; École de service social
Compiles data related to qualitative information for research purposes.

(n) University of British Columbia, Faculty of Law
Collects information on source, destination, transit and the demand for sex tourism involving Canadians through secondary sources.

(o) Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons, British Columbia
Collects information on demographics of trafficking in persons victims, forms of trafficking (labour, organ, sexual exploitation, etc.), movement type (transition, destination), state of physical and mental health, job type. Also collects information on responses to the cases including legal aspects, response of law enforcement and immigration, passport, deportation, Temporary Resident Permit, housing, referral system, other forms of support. Use information for research, education and awareness.

(p) The Salvation Army, Anti-Human Trafficking Network
Do not have a national database for those encountered that are trafficking in persons cases. There would be records of such identified as trafficking in persons cases through the Salvation Army center that assisted.

(q) Intercountry Adoption Services, Community Development and Partnerships Directorate
Collects information from embassies regarding situations in certain countries where we suspect the falsification of documents, different versions regarding the origin of children in orphanages, the trafficking of children, etc.

(r) Resist Exploitation, Embrace Dignity
Keep confidential case histories on all women they serve or come into contact with.

(s) Changing Together - A Centre for Immigrant Women
Completed an Environmental Scan identifying which service providers in Alberta have dealt with victims of human trafficking.

(t) Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking Humans, Carleton University
Collect anecdotal evidence about trafficked persons encountered by service providers in Ottawa, and about trafficked persons encountered by law enforcement in Ottawa. Also track number of participants attending information seminars and workshops provided by Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking Humans members.

Overall, the consultations found that there is a lack of comprehensive, reliable and comparable data on human trafficking. This is not surprising given the complexities involved in trying to measure human trafficking. Factors that make this an especially difficult area to collect data are the covert nature of trafficking, victims' reluctance to report to police, the challenge for law enforcement and border officials to recognize and identify this type of crime, and the sensitive nature of the data which makes access, sharing and inter-jurisdictional communication a challenge. It should be noted that while some organizations indicated that they do collect data, the details reveal that the information is gathered from secondary sources, or is qualitative or anecdotal in nature.

6 Indirect indicators

The extent of human trafficking can be measured in a number of ways. One means is through the collection of direct indicators (e.g., number of incidents, victims, accused). Alternatively, researchers have pointed to the use of indirect indicators as another possible measure of human trafficking (Laczko, 2003). Participants were asked to rank the relevance of potential indirect indicators in measuring human trafficking.

Of the suggested indirect indicators, 70% to 80% of respondents identified the following as potential **indirect measures** for human trafficking:

- the number of missing Aboriginal women and girls
- number of missing women
- number of missing children
- incidents of child pornography

- number of smuggled migrants
- number of illegal border crossings

In addition, participants suggested the following as other potential indirect indicators:

- incidents of child luring via the Internet (or attempted luring)
- the number of people detained by immigration officials
- the number of unaccompanied minors

However, many participants were skeptical about the utility of using indirect indicators to accurately measure the extent and nature of human trafficking. For example,

> "The items listed above may be useful indirect indicators of trafficking in persons, however, more information would need to be gathered to establish whether the red flags raised by such conduct are in fact linked to trafficking."

> "Most of the identified fields may have some correlation, but how scientifically could you possibly use this data to correlate the data to an empirical measure?"

> "The link between TIP and human smuggling has not been fully explored so there may be a benefit in looking at human smuggling in the context of TIP. It is known that persons (who willingly agree to being) smuggled may become victims of trafficking at any point during their journey. That said, it should be noted that TIP and human smuggling should be differentiated and those differences need to be accurately reflected in the numbers and in context piece."

7 Challenges

As previously mentioned, there are a number of complexities surrounding the measurement of human trafficking. Specifically, respondents identified four major hurdles:

1. the **lack of common, concise definitions** held by stakeholders;
2. difficulties in tracking TIP, particularly the **lack of awareness** surrounding this issue and **underreporting;**
3. **information sharing** due to the confidentiality of the data; and
4. securing **resources** to support sustainable data collection.

7.1 Definitions

A key hurdle that will need to be faced is that of definition. As revealed through the consultations, the definitions and basic understanding of what constitutes human trafficking (and what does not) is neither clear nor consistent across the different stakeholders.

In order to obtain an accurate and comprehensive picture of human trafficking in Canada, it is first necessary to identify and engage all stakeholders involved in data collection efforts that are currently underway or planned for the future. These stakeholders would include representatives from applicable government departments, law enforcement, immigration and border services, service providers and NGOs. It would then be necessary to develop a set of standard, clear definitions and criteria that can be agreed to and adopted by all stakeholders in order to consistently identify trafficked victims.

A number of challenges in the development of, and agreement on, a set of common definitions are anticipated. For example, each stakeholder collects information on human trafficking to serve their internal needs. That is, police collect data based on criminal incidents, the RCMP collects intelligence information, NGOs collect information about

the persons to whom they provide services, and border security officers collect information about investigations into suspicious persons attempting to cross Canadian borders. As such, each of these agencies collects a different unit of count (i.e., incidents, victims, investigations) which presents particular challenges for data collection, compilation and reporting.

In addition, stakeholders use different definitions and criteria when identifying the status of a victim. Perhaps this is due, in part, because each agency encounters victims at a different point along the human trafficking continuum. For example, when officials intercept at the point of entry into the destination country, the victim may not consider themselves to be a trafficking victim as they may be unaware of potential exploitation. The perpetrator may have facilitated the illegal entry of another across an international border, but may not necessarily be referred to as a trafficker. Alternatively, during a police raid, a person may be 'suspected' of being a trafficked victim. After further investigation, the person may or may not be confirmed by authorities to be a trafficking victim. In other instances, a person may be confirmed as being a trafficked person only after being granted a Temporary Resident Permit (TRP) and receiving services, the person may then be considered an 'ex-victim' of human trafficking.

Another issue which needs to be addressed is to ensure that victims are not double-counted. Victims of trafficking may come into contact with not only the police but also court officials, immigration officers and service providers. However, a national data collection system would need to ensure that victims are counted only once for the purpose of determining the number of trafficked victims.

> "Any data collection system will have to ensure common definitions and understanding of terms and the *Criminal Code* offences so that there is a consistent collection and input of data."

7.2 Awareness and reporting

A second set of challenges to overcome are the difficulties inherent in identifying and reporting on a phenomenon that is hidden and covert by nature. Accurate data on trafficking depends on the ability of police, border and immigration officials to recognize and identify potential cases of human trafficking. Until there is widespread awareness, identification and reporting of this issue, data on trafficking will continue to be underreported. This underscores the importance of continued training for all front-line officials including police, immigration officials and border security. In addition, there is a need for increased education and awareness among service providers including social workers in shelters, medical personnel, sexual assault centres, NGOs, and others in how to identify and effectively manage human trafficking cases.

> "Education of both law enforcement and non-law enforcement agencies to accurately score the data and report same without bias. Education of all involved to recognize a human trafficking case and respond appropriately."

> "The clandestine nature of human trafficking makes it difficult to collect data at all. Furthermore, since many trafficked persons are fearful of coming forward or do not perceive themselves as victims, further opportunities for data collection may be lost."

Effective reporting also depends upon the willingness of victims to come forward and report their experiences. When victims of human trafficking feel threatened, distrust the authorities, or do not consider themselves as victims of human trafficking, they are less likely to report to the authorities.

7.3 Information sharing

The third challenge noted by respondents was that of information sharing. Restricted data sharing due to confidentiality and respondent protection were seen as barriers to the collection of national trafficking data.

> "Privacy and confidentiality will be a concern. We believe that there should be consultation on this particular point and would like to be included in any discussion of the means by which to overcome these challenges. Privacy is the reason that we have proposed the anonymized database accessible by a large number of government agencies and service providers. In this case, a wide variety of actors would have to be trained to input data in a consistent fashion, in order for conclusions drawn from the information to be accurate."

"May not be able to share intelligence information."

"One challenge which may arise when trying to share and compile data is that different agencies and departments may employ different definitions of TIP or may identify victims in different ways. This could result in too many or too few people being identified. As identified above the problem of "double-counting" will also have to be addressed. Standard definitions and methods of counting would need to be established in order to minimize this risk. Privacy concerns may also arise with respect to the sharing of information. For example, when compiling information on victims of TIP to be submitted to the UN on behalf of Canada, privacy concerns prevented the origin countries of TIP victims from being shared. Therefore it will be important to ensure that data collection is presented in an aggregate form sufficient to protect the privacy interests of victims."

"Different software and data collection systems. There is a need for a harmonized approach. Privacy issues and information sharing barriers."

Currently, there is not a system in place in Canada that has the capability to capture, collate and integrate data from the various departments and organizations that collect TIP information. The development and implementation of a data and information sharing network between government departments at the federal, provincial and territorial levels, as well as non-government organizations will prove to be a very complex, challenging and costly endeavour.

7.4 Resources for sustainable data collection

A final obstacle highlighted by respondents in developing a national data collection strategy for human trafficking is securing the significant resources that would be necessary to support sustainable data collection. Respondents identified a need to develop the capacity to monitor and maintain information systems that collect data on human trafficking.

Ideally, one central agency, with the capacity and legal authority, would draw data from several different sources to meet their information needs. However, this is not currently the case; it is a very difficult, resource-intensive exercise to bring data together from different sources, when agencies are operating with different information needs, data collection systems, definitions, capacities and formats for reporting. A database attempting to integrate data from multiple sources, without standard fields, agreed upon data collection practices and reporting mechanisms is destined to be unsuccessful.

Recognizing that a fragmented data collection approach cannot and will not yield credible and accurate results, there is a need to standardize the way information is collected across all stakeholders. This will not only lead to standardized and comparable datasets, but it also has the potential to significantly enhance the efficiency and targeting of counter-trafficking responses.

"The lack of primary and accurate data is a serious barrier to the effective monitoring and evaluation of Canada's anti-trafficking efforts. Anti-trafficking stakeholders cannot know what is working or identify where the gaps exist if they do not have access to accurate data to help understand the phenomenon."

8 Conclusion

8.1 A framework for data collection on human trafficking

The overriding theme throughout the consultations was the lack of reliable, consistent data on the scope and nature of human trafficking in Canada. The underground nature of trafficking networks, victims' reluctance to report crimes to the authorities, difficulties in identifying victims, and the sensitive nature of the data are all factors that present real challenges for reliable data collection. Furthermore, the minimal information that is available in Canada is dispersed across different departments and organizations including the police, border services and NGOs each using their own criteria to define a victim of trafficking thus generating non-comparable information. In the absence of reliable ongoing information to inform the issue, it is unknown whether incidents of human trafficking are increasing or decreasing or

whether the current justice responses are effective. This makes it difficult to know how to develop effective policies and programs.

Consultations confirmed that a number of knowledge gaps remain concerning human trafficking in Canada, including:

1. stakeholders are **not able to answer the most basic questions** about human trafficking;
2. **very few organizations or government departments systematically collect data** on human trafficking;
3. there are **definitional inconsistencies** across agencies/organizations;
4. consensus is required concerning the **types of human trafficking that are important to collect**;
5. there are **many challenges** to overcome in collecting accurate data on TIP; and,
6. **data sharing** may be the most challenging hurdle to overcome.

Research compiled for this study indicates that the development of a sound framework for ongoing data collection for human trafficking would not only help fulfill Canada's commitments under the *Trafficking Protocol*, but would also provide a fuller understanding of this crime in Canada.

However, in order to accomplish this goal, the data that are collected, compiled and reported must be in line with the overall objectives and the information needs identified, while building in enough flexibility to manage the complexities and changing nature of human trafficking both in Canada and internationally. In addition, data collected must accurately represent the universe that we are trying to capture.

The fundamental principles listed below will help guide any future development of a framework for TIP data collection:

1. develop consensus on how to define a victim of human trafficking;
2. develop standardized and consistent methods to collect human trafficking data across all stakeholders;
3. identify a core set of data on incidents, victims and traffickers. Consensus is required on which direct indicators are necessary to collect; and,
4. ensure that all data collected be kept confidential.

In order to move towards a fuller understanding of human trafficking, a broad and multi-sectoral perspective is required. As such, strengthening partnerships across all stakeholders and improving inter-agency communication, co-operation and information sharing will enhance data collection efforts.

8.2 Possible approaches towards a data collection framework

Based on the information collected through the consultations and on what information is currently available or could be available, the following series of possible approaches could be considered to address the current gaps in data collection and research.

1. Common understanding of TIP definitions

One of the major difficulties revealed through the consultation process is that existing data on human trafficking are collected by various government departments, NGOs, service agencies and police departments to serve their internal needs. Each agency encounters TIP victims at a different point in the trafficking process using different units of count (incidents, victims, investigations). No one agency has a complete picture. This presents particular challenges for data collection and compilation.

As a first step towards comparable data collection, there is a need to develop a standardized set of definitions and concepts to allow for the collection and reporting of comparable data across the different sectors.

2. Explore the feasibility and implications of enhancing the content of existing CCJS surveys

The Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics of Statistics Canada conducts a number of criminal justice surveys that currently collect, or could potentially collect, information to further enhance our understanding of human trafficking including the:

- Incident-based Uniform Crime Reporting Survey (UCR2);
- Integrated Criminal Court Survey (ICCS);
- Integrated Correctional Services Survey (ICSS);
- Transition Home Survey (THS);
- Victim Services Survey (VSS); and,
- Homicide Survey.

The CCJS, in co-operation with the policing community, collects annual police-reported crime statistics through the **Incident-based Uniform Crime Reporting Survey (UCR2).** In 2008, UCR2 data were collected from 155 police services across Canada representing 98% of the population. The UCR2 Survey is currently able to identify the three *Criminal Code* incidents related to trafficking in persons,[2] detailed characteristics about the victims of human trafficking and their traffickers (including age, sex, charges laid or recommended, location, province, level of injury, etc). As well, the UCR2 Survey can identify the total number of incidents reported by police that fall within the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act*.

In an effort to address some of the information gaps identified through the consultation process, the feasibility and implications of adding content to the UCR2 Survey could be explored.

Possible data gaps that may be considered could include:

- distinguishing between the different types of trafficking exploitation (e.g., sexual exploitation, forced labour, human organs/tissues, etc.);
- identifying 'suspected' victims -those identified but not confirmed by authorities;
- distinguishing between domestic and international incidents of TIP;
- ascertaining the number of incidents that were attributed to organized crime;
- isolating the number of incidents under the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA)* by section number (i.e., s.118);
- identifying TIP-related incidents that were not charged using the 3 TIP offences but under other criminal offences i.e., kidnapping, forcible confinement, uttering threats, extortion, assault, sexual assault, prostitution-related offences, offences against the sexual exploitation of children (i.e., child pornography or child prostitution) and criminal organization offences.

In addition to police-reported data, information about human trafficking offences is available through the **Integrated Criminal Court Survey (ICCS)** at the CCJS. The Integrated Criminal Court Survey collects detailed caseload, case processing and sentencing information for all *Criminal Code* and other federal statute charges heard in criminal courts in Canada, specifically, data on the number of charges and cases heard in the courts, the type of decision, the number of convictions and the type of sentence.

2. The UCR2 Survey began recording incidents of TIP reported to/or identified by police in 2005 since the enactment of the three new TIP offences.

CCJS also collects microdata on adults and youth in the correctional system in Canada through the **Integrated Correctional Services Survey (ICSS)**. The survey collects person-based microdata on adults and youth under the responsibility of the Canadian correctional system (federal, provincial and territorial adult and youth), including the number of persons admitted to remand and sentenced custody for specific criminal offences including human trafficking (by *Criminal Code* section), detailed socio-demographic characteristics such as age, sex, Aboriginal identity, citizenship and education status as well as information pertaining to important aspects of a person's correctional supervision including criminogenic needs, conditions of community release, breaches of supervision.

The **Transition Home Survey (THS)**, developed under the federal government's Family Violence Initiative in consultation with provincial/territorial governments and transition home associations, collects data on the characteristics of residential services for women and their children seeking refuge. The survey also collects information on selected characteristics of the women and children residing in these shelters on a specified day. Shelters that serve not only women escaping domestic violence, such as those providing residential services to men and women seeking refuge for other reasons are also included on the survey. Enhancements that could possibly be made to the THS Survey could include:

- the number of TIP victims sheltered by these residential facilities,
- the number of beds available to TIP victims in these residential facilities, and
- the number of adult and child TIP victims accessing shelters by gender.

The CCJS, with funding from Justice Canada's Policy Centre for Victim Issues, conducted its first national **Victim Services Survey (VSS)** in 2003. Recognizing the need to monitor the number and types of victim service agencies and to address emerging issues in the field of victim services, the survey has been repeated on a biennial basis since that time. Developed in consultation with federal, provincial and territorial ministries responsible for justice and victim services, and with a number of victim service agencies from across Canada, the survey provides a profile of victim service agencies, information on the types of services offered, and insight into the clients who use them through a snapshot of clients served on a specific date. In addition, the survey collects standardized information from criminal injuries compensation and other financial benefit programs regarding applications for compensation and awards for victims of crime. Possible enhancements to the VSS could include the collection of data on:

- the types of services provided to TIP victims, and
- the number of adult and child TIP victims receiving services.

The **Homicide Survey** began collecting detailed police-reported data on homicide incidents, victim characteristics and characteristics of accused persons in Canada in 1961. When a homicide becomes known to the police, the investigating police department completes a survey questionnaire and forwards it to the CCJS. The survey collects detailed information about the homicide incident, the characteristics of the victim(s) and accused person(s) including location, relationship between the victim and the accused, whether the homicide was related to another offence, motive, etc. It may be possible to add a field to the Homicide Survey to capture details about those incidents of human trafficking that led to a homicide.

Impacts of modifying existing surveys

Introducing modifications to existing surveys is a complex, lengthy and potentially costly process requiring considerable developmental work, systems modification and adjustments to current reporting systems, updating manuals, testing and training. In addition, issues ranging from internal priorities and competing resources, to logistics in the re-development of data capture systems, and funding all impact on the implementation of these modifications. Therefore, as a first step, the feasibility and implications of adding content to these surveys will need to be explored.

While some of the data gaps could potentially be addressed through possible modifications to CCJS surveys, other data gaps may be better addressed through alternate data collection methods or through data that are collected by other departments or organizations. For example:

- nationality, country of origin, citizenship of victims or accused;
- human trafficking flows (source and destination countries); and,
- profits generated through TIP.

3. Additional research on data holdings by government departments, NGOs and service providers

Future research could be undertaken to further explore the type and extent of national data holdings related to human trafficking obtained by government (provincial and federal), NGOs and service providers. This would include updating information contained in this report (see list of Agencies in section 5). This research could also examine options on how such data holdings can be reported in a consistent manner across NGOs, agencies and various government departments.

In addition, consultations revealed that NGOs and organizations providing services to victims of human trafficking have a wealth of information about their clientele; however, these organizations do not have a systematic method for collecting, reporting and sharing these valuable data. Therefore, future research could examine possible methods of sharing information between these stakeholders in order to facilitate the possible development of a national data collection framework on human trafficking.

8.3 Possible research projects

Both short and long-term strategies are required to address gaps in information and to strengthen our knowledge base regarding human trafficking. The following identifies a number of potential directions for ongoing and future research.

Enhance understanding of TIP for forced labour

Canadian police intelligence indicates that trafficked persons are predominantly forced to work in the sex trade. Human trafficking for the purpose of forced labour has received less attention in Canada.

Common forms of labour into which people are trafficked include: construction, agriculture, mining, manufacturing, domestic service and the restaurant business. Information from the International Organization for Migration indicates that trafficked labourers frequently suffer physical injuries, are exposed to infectious and communicable disease, post-traumatic mental health symptoms and isolation and are more likely to be exposed to hazardous working conditions (e.g., increased exposure to irritants and carcinogens).

Enhance understanding of domestically trafficked victims

While Canada is not known to be a significant country of origin for victims, reported case law and information from ongoing investigations confirm that Canadian nationals are trafficked wholly within Canada. It is believed that victims that are being trafficked within Canada are largely destined for major centres such as Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver. *http://www.cisc.gc.ca/products_services/domestic_trafficking_persons/document/sib_web_en.pdf*.

Organized crime and human trafficking

The CISC indicates that a link exists between organized crime networks and trafficking for sexual exploitation in Canada. Estimates indicate that most organized crime groups have the capacity to move multiple victims simultaneously, typically inter-provincially. *http://www.cisc.gc.ca/annual_reports/annual_report_2008/document/report_oc_2008_e.pdf*.

Not all trafficking in persons involves organized crime groups. It can also be carried out by smaller groups of individuals, family and extended family members or loosely organized groups. However, given the potential profits to be generated, organized criminal groups are attracted to trafficking in human beings.

Continued and ongoing research into the link between organized crime and TIP would add to the overall understanding of human trafficking. In addition, the Financial Transactions Reports Analysis Centre of Canada's (FINTRAC) continued monitoring into potential linkages between human trafficking and money laundering, and

pursuing the potential avenue of confiscation of proceeds of crime generated through TIP may provide additional information that could be mined for further insights.

Links between human trafficking and other crimes

Additional research is required to understand the links between human trafficking and other crimes such as drug trafficking, child pornography or terrorist activities.

8.4 Enhancing awareness through training and handbooks

The development and distribution of training manuals or handbooks on human trafficking has the potential not only to enhance awareness, but also may increase the identification and reporting of trafficking cases to the authorities, thus increasing the collection of national statistics on this issue. In addition to ongoing efforts, a range of manuals or training courses could be developed, whether by government or non-government organizations, that address specific audiences including:

TIP guide for Canadian law enforcement

The RCMP has updated the existing TIP reference guide for Canadian law enforcement to include additional information about the identification and protection of victims and useful tips for interviewing victims. This reference guide is intended for distribution to law enforcement agencies nationwide. The RCMP is also preparing an awareness video which will include information about domestic human trafficking cases as well as trafficking for forced labour. *http://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/imm_pass/index_e.htm*.

Consideration could potentially be given to the broader distribution of these reference tools to border security personnel at Canadian borders and International Liaison Officers who are strategically located around the world which could further increase awareness and reporting of human trafficking.

Educating judges, lawyers and prosecutors

Similar to the development of training materials and videos for law enforcement officers as is currently being undertaken by the RCMP, there is also a need to educate judges, lawyers and prosecutors. Sensitizing the judiciary to the issue of human trafficking in Canada may serve to increase the identification of trafficking cases, offenders and their victims, which in turn, may increase data collection on human trafficking.

A handbook for health care providers

Throughout the trafficking cycle, victims are likely to experience physical, sexual and/or psychological abuse while having limited or no access to health services. The development of a comprehensive manual could serve as a tool to improve understanding among healthcare professionals about human trafficking including the identification of potential victims, their specific medical needs, referral of potential victims to service providers and NGOs, and contacting local law enforcement. Enhancing the ability of healthcare providers in identifying trafficking victims may, in turn, result in increased data collection.

For example, the Rescue & Restore Victims of Human Trafficking campaign in the United States helps identify and assist victims of trafficking. A resource guide was specifically developed for healthcare providers and includes a range of information including tips for identifying and helping victims, screening questions to assist in the identification of victims, and health problems seen in TIP victims, etc. *http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/rescue_restore/index.html*.

Manual for NGOs and service providers

Front-line professionals who come into contact with potential victims of human trafficking may have some indications that the person has been trafficked, but they may not be fully confident of their assessment. A handbook could include guidelines for initial screening and identification of potentially trafficked victims, interviewing techniques, crisis intervention, needs assessment, services to offer, referrals, as well as reporting incidents of human trafficking to law enforcement authorities. The use of this type of tool could potentially improve the quality of services provided to victims of trafficking, and could also enhance the collection of national statistics.

9 Summary

9.1 Quantifying human trafficking

Currently, there is a lack of reliable, quantitative data on the scope and nature of human trafficking in Canada and around the world. The reasons for this are many, but essentially the challenges lie in the hidden nature of the crime, victims' reluctance to report crimes to the authorities, difficulties in identifying victims, the high degree of underreporting, and the sensitive nature of the data which present challenges for access, sharing and inter-jurisdictional communication. Furthermore, the minimal information that is available is scattered across different departments and organizations, each using their own criteria to define a victim of trafficking.

This study on human trafficking provides a 'blueprint' of possible approaches for the development of information to improve Canada's capacity to address key policy questions through evidence-based data. The report identifies a number of data collection and research strategies that could contribute to a better understanding of the nature and scope of human trafficking in Canada, which is fundamental not only in addressing Canada's international obligations under the *Trafficking Protocol* but also to provide a broader and deeper understanding of this criminal phenomenon in Canada.

Respondents to the consultations indicated that there is a need to increase our knowledge base about human trafficking, and to look at its various forms (sexual exploitation, forced labour, organs, etc.) and its many victims (women, men, children) both nationally and internationally. A concerted effort in the area of data collection would be required to achieve a rigorous data program. The development of standardized and consistently applied definitions and concepts would be necessary in order to consistently measure, compare and interpret data across jurisdictions and over time, on the prevalence and nature of human trafficking in Canada.

10 Bibliography

Artigas, C. 2004. *Improving Data and Research on Human Trafficking*. Presentation at the International Expert Meeting, International Organization for Migration, May 27-28, 2004. Rome. *http://www.eclac.org/dds/noticias/noticias/1/14771/Carmen_Artigas_20052004.pdf* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

Folden, C., M. Manke and T. Mortensen. 2007. *Sharing Data: Where to Start. An Emerging Approach to Migration Data Management*. International Organization for Migration. Vienna, Austria. *http://publications.iom.int/bookstore/index.php?main_page=product_info&cPath=19&products_id=102* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

Gallagher, A. and P. Holmes. 2008. "Developing an effective criminal justice response to human trafficking. Lessons from the front line." *International Criminal Justice Review*. Vol. 18, No. 3. p. 318-343.

Goodey, J. 2008. "Human trafficking. Sketchy data and policy responses." *Criminology and Criminal Justice*. Vol. 8, No. 4. p. 421-442.

International Organization for Migration. 2009. *Guidelines for the Collection of Data on Trafficking in Human Beings, Including Comparable Indicators*. Austria.

International Organization for Migration. 2007. *Asean and Trafficking in Persons. Using Data as a Tool to Combat Trafficking in Persons*. International Organization for Migration, Geneva, Switzerland. *http://www.iom.int/jahia/webdav/site/myjahiasite/shared/shared/mainsite/published_docs/books/lowres%20asean%20report-complete.pdf* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

International Organization for Migration. 2007. *Handbook on Anti-Trafficking Data Collection in South-Eastern Europe: Developing Regional Criteria*. International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD). Vienna, Austria. *http://www.anti-trafficking.net/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/DCIM/DCIM_handbook_final_EN.pdf* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

International Organization for Migration. *Developing New Approaches to the Study of Human Trafficking. Draft Report*. UN Global Initiative to Fight Trafficking (UN.GIFT). Expert Group Meeting. Cairo, Egypt. Jan. 11-12, 2008.

International Organization for Migration. *Technical Consultation on Forced Labour Indicators, Data Collection and National Estimates*. Summary Report, ILO. Geneva, Switzerland. Dec. 13-14, 2006. *http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_081981.pdf* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

Kangaspunta, K. 2003. "Mapping the inhuman trade: Preliminary findings of the database on trafficking in human beings." *Forum on Crime and Society*. Vol. 3, Nos. 1 and 2. p. 81-103.

Kutnick, B., P. Belser and G. Danailova-Trainor. 2007. *Methodologies for Global and National Estimation of Human Trafficking Victims: Current and Future Approaches*. International Labour Office (ILO). Geneva, Switzerland. *http://www.ilo.org/sapfl/Informationresources/ILOPublications/lang--en/docName--WCMS_081989/index.htm* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

Laczko, F. and E. Gozdziak. 2005. *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey*. International Organization for Migration. Geneva, Switzerland. *http://www.iom.int/jahia/webdav/site/myjahiasite/shared/shared/mainsite/published_docs/books/data_res_human.pdf* (Accessed May 5, 2010).

Laczko, F. and M.A. Gramegna. 2003. "Developing better indicators of human trafficking." *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*. Vol. X, Issue 1. p. 179-194. *http://www.watsoninstitute.org/bjwa/archive/10.1/SexTrafficking/Laczko.pdf* (Accessed May 6, 2010).

Laczko, F. 2002. "Human trafficking: The need for better data." *Migration Information Source*, Migration Policy Institute, Washington, DC. *http://www.migrationinformation.org/feature/display.cfm?ID=66* (Accessed May 6, 2010).

Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings. 2008. *Efforts to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings in the OSCE Area: Co-ordination and Reporting Mechanism*. Annual Report. Vienna, Austria. Nov. 2008. *http://www.osce.org/publications/cthb/2009/02/36298_1253_en.pdf* (Accessed March 25, 2010).

Savona, E. and S. Stefanizzi (eds) 2007. *Measuring Human Trafficking. Complexities and Pitfalls*. Springer Press.

Trafficking in Human Beings – Fifth Report of the Dutch National Rapporteur. 2007. The Hague. Bureau NRM.

Tyldum, G. and A. Brunovskis. 2005. "Describing the unobserved: Methodological challenges in empirical studies on human trafficking." *International Migration*. Vol. 43 (1/2). p. 17-34.

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. 2009. *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*. *http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Global_Report_on_TIP.pdf* (Accessed March 25, 2010).

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. *Protocol to Suppress, Prevent and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children*. *www.unodc.org/unodc/en/treaties/CTOC/index.html#Fulltext* (Accessed January, 2009).

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. 2008. *Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons*. Global Programme against Trafficking in Human Beings. United Nations. New York. *http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Toolkit-files/07-89375_Ebook[1].pdf* (Accessed March 25, 2010).

United States Department of Justice. 2009. Kyckelhahn, T., A. Beck and T. Cohen. *Characteristics of Suspected Human Trafficking Incidents, 2007-08*. Bureau of Justice Statistics Special Report. Washington, DC. January 2009. *http://bjs.ojp.usdoj.gov/content/pub/pdf/cshti08.pdf* (Accessed March 25, 2010).

United States Department of State. 2008. *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. Washington, DC. June. *http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/105501.pdf* (Accessed March 25, 2010).

United States Government Accountability Office (GAO). 2006. *Human Trafficking. Better Data, Strategy and Reporting Needed to Enhance U.S. Antitrafficking Efforts Abroad*. Washington, DC. *http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d06825.pdf* (Accessed March 25, 2010).

Van Impe, K. 2000. "People for sale: The need for a multidisciplinary approach towards human trafficking." *International Migration*, Special Issue, 2000/01. p. 113-131. Blackwell Publishers Ltd. UK.

Vermeulen, G. et al. 2006. *The SIAMSECT Files: Standardized Templates and Blueprints for EU Wide Collection of Statistical Information and Analysis on Missing and Sexually Exploited Children and Trafficking in Human Beings*. Antwerp: European Commission, Institute for International Research and Criminal Policy and Transcrime.

Appendix I — Key stakeholder consultation list

The following lists the organizations and agencies that were asked to participate in the consultation process.

Interdepartmental working group on trafficking in persons (IWGTIP)[1]

- Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA)
- Canadian Heritage
- Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA)
- Criminal Intelligence Service Canada (CISC)
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC)
- Department of Justice Canada (JUS)
- Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade (DFAIT)
- Health Canada (HC)
- Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (HRSDC)
- Indian and Northern Affairs Canada (INAC)
- Passport Canada
- Public Safety Canada (PS)
- Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP)
- Statistics Canada (StatCan)
- Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Other federal departments and organizations

- National Defence
- Intercountry Adoption Services, HRSDC
- Social Programs Analysis Division, HRSDC
- Headquarters Counsel Group, JUS
- Financial Transactions Reports Analysis Centre of Canada (FINTRAC)

1. The list identifies those representatives of the IWGTIP during the time of consultations and may not represent the current membership.

- Anti-Fraud and Human Trafficking, CBSA
- Children's Rights and Protection Unit, Human Rights and Participation Division, CIDA
- Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, CMHC
- Public Prosecution Service of Canada, PPSC
- Privy Council Office (PCO)

Provincial/territorial departments and focal points

- The British Columbia Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP)
- Alberta Solicitor General and Public Security, Victim Services Branch
- Alberta Employment, Immigration and Industry, Government of Alberta
- Child Sexual Exploitation, Government of Alberta
- Saskatchewan Ministry of Justice and Attorney General
- Manitoba Labour and Immigration, Government of Manitoba
- Manitoba Family Services and Housing, Government of Manitoba
- Manitoba Justice, Government of Manitoba
- Santé et services sociaux, Gouvernement du Québec

Law enforcement

- Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre (HTNCC), RCMP
- National Missing Children Services, RCMP
- National Crime Prevention Services Branch, RCMP
- RCMP, London, Trafficking Awareness Coordinator 'O'
- RCMP, Halifax, Human Trafficking Coordinator
- RCMP, Toronto area, Human Trafficking Coordinator
- York Regional Police
- Ottawa Police
- Vancouver Police
- Calgary Police
- Winnipeg Police
- Halifax Police

Academics

- Université de Montréal, Interdisciplinary Research Centre on Family Violence and Violence against Women, (CRI-VIFF), École de service social
- McGill University, Montreal, School of Social Work
- University of British Columbia, Law Department
- Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking Humans (PACT), Carleton University

Non-government organizations

- Anti-Human Trafficking Network, The Salvation Army, Winnipeg
- Beyond Borders, Winnipeg
- Canadian Centre for Child Protection, Winnipeg
- Canadian Council for Refugees, Montreal
- Changing Together, A Centre for Immigrant Women, Edmonton
- Elizabeth Fry Society, British Columbia
- Family Services of Greater Vancouver
- Family Services, Government of Manitoba
- International Bureau for Children's Rights, Montreal
- International Centre to Combat Exploitation of Children, Vancouver, BC
- Mosaic Settlement Services, British Columbia
- Resist Exploitation, Embrace Dignity (REED),Vancouver
- Resolve Manitoba, Winnipeg
- Servants Anonymous Society
- Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelters, Vancouver, British Columbia

Appendix II — International approaches to trafficking in persons data collection

A range of approaches to the collection of data on human trafficking have been developed and initiated in a number of European countries and in the United States. The following section briefly outlines some examples of these international activities which may provide insights and offer lessons learned for Canada.

National Rapporteur on trafficking in human beings

The Dutch National Rapporteur on trafficking in human beings was established in 2000 as an independent office reporting to the government on the nature and extent of human trafficking in the Netherlands. The Rapporteur gathers information from individuals, organizations and authorities that assist victims and issues policy recommendations aimed at improving the fight against human trafficking. The Rapporteur is granted access to criminal files held by police and judicial authorities. Due to the cross-border nature of the crime of human trafficking, the Rapporteur co-operates with international organizations. An annual report is produced and made public which contains information on relevant regulations and legislation, as well as information on prevention, criminal investigations regarding human trafficking, prosecution of perpetrators and victim support. The Dutch Rapporteur does not investigate trafficking cases, prosecute perpetrators, assist victims nor is it a complaints body. *http://english.bnrm.nl/reports/fifth*

In a similar vein, the Swedish Government appointed the National Police Board of Sweden as the National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Women in compliance with the Hague Declaration in 1997. Subsequently, the National Police Board delegated the task to the National Criminal Police. The mandate of the Rapporteur includes the collection and analysis of data and information about the extent of human trafficking into Sweden, as well as recommendations related to combating trafficking and prevention. In the annual reports, the Rapporteur reviews the connection between human trafficking and other crimes including human smuggling, prostitution and sexual exploitation.

International Organization for Migration

Since 2000, the International Organization for Migration (IOM) has collected data on victims of trafficking who have been assisted through the Organization's counter-trafficking programs. The IOM Counter Trafficking Module (CTM) database is a tool that facilitates the management of assistance, voluntary return and reintegration activities for victims of trafficking, and strengthens the research capacity and understanding of the causes, processes, trends and consequences of trafficking.

The CTM serves a number of functions: it stores information collected from trafficking victims that were assisted, thus enhancing understanding of their background, trafficking experience and needs. The tool also facilitates coordination between IOM missions on individual cases, tracks activities, and monitors/evaluates programs. It also serves as a data bank from which statistics and detailed reports can be drawn to help inform research, program development and policy-making. Strict controls designed to ensure the confidentiality and security of all data has been established to ensure that the privacy or identity of trafficked individuals is not released.

Drawing upon this technology and methodology, the IOM is currently developing the database as an external case management and data collection tool to be used by NGOs and governments. The IOM has also developed a handbook to help guide this development entitled: *"The IOM Handbook on Direct Assistance for Victims of Trafficking."*

The IOM global trafficking database has been commended for being systematic, assisting efforts to compile better data on trafficking victims by using a standardized IOM database structure, methodology and core indicators which allow for the collection of comparable data. *www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/pid/1235*.

International Labour Organization

In 2004 the International Labour Organization (ILO) examined methodologies which could be used to estimate the full extent of trafficking for the purpose of forced labour. Indicators for this study were compiled by first developing a methodological framework based on the ILO Conventions on Forced Labour and on the *Palermo Protocol*, then customizing a set of indicators to the national context and transcribing them into a set of questions which were added to an appropriate household survey. The survey sought to capture information from returning migrant workers to assess the risk of trafficking.

The sub-group of the European Commission's Expert Group on Trafficking in Human Beings emphasized the need for the collection of statistics beyond the collation of existing official crime statistics and recommended that data should also be collected from other relevant sources including NGOs and labour inspectors.

The initial results of this project were published in 2005, when the ILO estimated that at least 12.3 million people were in situations of forced labour around the world, and that 2.4 million were victims of human trafficking. These global figures have been cited worldwide to draw attention to the urgency of developing more reliable statistics at the national level, providing guidance to policy makers as well as benchmarks for measuring progress over time. *http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_081989.pdf*

Europol

The mandate of Europol is 'to improve the effectiveness and cooperation in preventing and combating various forms of serious international forms of organized crime, including human trafficking'. Cooperation in combating human trafficking is facilitated by the exchange of information and analytical support to ongoing investigations. Europol stores and analyses data in an automated system that consists of two components: the Europol Information System (EIS) and the Analysis Work File (AWF). The Europol Convention outlines a strict framework for data protection control, supervision and security.

The EIS is the central database for storing information at Europol's Headquarters in The Hague. The detailed information in this database is shared with authorized users in all European Union member states. The Analysis Work File (AWF) is the method through which Europol provides analytical support to ongoing investigations. AWF identifies particular criminal networks involved in all forms of human trafficking within, into and from the European Union. This tool facilitates investigations in different member states through the assessment of trends and potential threats posed by the activity of organized crime groups involved in human trafficking.

International Centre for Migration Policy Development

In 2006, the International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) initiated the "Program for the Enhancement of Anti-trafficking Responses in South-Eastern Europe – Data Collection and Information Management (DCIM)." The project's objectives were to harmonize and improve the quality and reliability of data on the prevention, protection and prosecution of human trafficking cases in South-Eastern Europe.

The ICMPD developed two distinct databases: a victim-centered database that collects data on trafficked persons, and one that collects information on perpetrators of human trafficking and tracks their cases through the judicial process. The basis for the development of the two databases was initiated by research conducted and published in the *"Handbook on Anti-Trafficking Data Collection in South-EasternEurope: Developing Regional Criteria."*

In 2008, phase II of the project was launched: "Trafficking in Human Beings: Data Collection and Harmonized Information Management Systems (DCIM-EU)". The objective was to create a trans-national information management system that includes the development of commonly accepted and comparable indicators for collecting data and information on victims of trafficking and traffickers. *www.anti-trafficking.net/*

Observatory and Resource Centre on Trafficking in Human Beings (Italy)

In 2005, Italy established the Observatory and Resource Centre on Trafficking in Human Beings (Osservatorio Tratta). Its main objectives are 'to offer new skills and tools to professionals engaged in the anti-trafficking sector and to design and implement coordination mechanisms amongst different counter-trafficking agencies at national and transnational levels'. The Observatory is composed of a diversified partnership of private and public agencies with an extensive experience in providing services directly to victims of trafficking.

Among a number of its initiatives, the Observatory has developed tools to study, gather and process data on human trafficking with a view to establishing a permanent monitoring system on human trafficking.

Italy: Manuals and training

The Italian Ministry of the Interior participated in the project "Fight against Trafficking in Human Beings to the EU from EU Accession and Neighbouring Countries: Operational Network and Multidisciplinary Training Process". The project began in 2004 was funded by the European Commission, DG Justice, Liberty and Security under the AGIS Program. It was implemented over a three-year period and involved different sectors including government and non-governmental organizations, law enforcement and judicial authorities, legal practitioners, social workers and training professionals.

The Project resulted in the development of two manuals (*The AGIS Guides on Best Practices for Students and Trainers*), the implementation of training courses and a presentation to an international audience in May 2007 in Rome. The aim of this seminar was the joint development of a common set of indicators for the identification of human trafficking and its victims.

The added value of this 3-year initiative was the implementation of a multidisciplinary and multidimensional approach that involved professionals from different operational areas (law enforcement bodies, prosecutors, judges, NGOs and international organizations). Participants were engaged in both the development of the manuals and in the preparation of trainers in order to develop a common approach to prevention and victim protection.

The SIAMSECT files and MONTRASEC project

The SIAMSECT files refer to the templates developed for the European Union for the purpose of collecting a wide range of statistical information and analysis on missing and sexually exploited children and victims of human trafficking. The templates allow for standardized and integrated statistical information and strategic analysis at both the Member State and EU level. Three templates were created: (1) trafficking in human beings, (2) sexual exploitation of children and (3) missing children. The indicators were developed based on previous projects, literature reviews, consultations with various international organizations, criminal law definitions, variables used by law enforcement authorities, and working definitions used by governmental and non-governmental organizations.

In order to enhance the practical application of these templates, they were transformed into a user-friendly database – the MONTRASEC. The objective of the MONTRASEC project was to develop a ready-to-use, statistical IT platform that brings together different data from relevant partners into an integrated data collection mechanism. *http://www.transcrime.unitn.it/tc/817.php*

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC)

In 2002, UNODC established a Trafficking Database on flows of trafficking in human beings. This database aimed to systematically collect open source information on human trafficking in order to collate and publish reported information that identifies international human trafficking routes, origin, transit and destination countries, and to shed light on the demographics of trafficked victims and offenders.

In April 2006, UNODC published the report "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns" which maps the flows of human trafficking. The report identifies the main reported patterns of human trafficking at the national, regional and global levels, including the relationship between origin, transit and destination countries, sub-regions and regions. *www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/HT-globalpatterns-en.pdf*

The UNODC mapping exercise under the UN.GIFT

The UNODC Global Research is designed to carry out proactive data collection on the number of traffickers arrested, prosecuted, convicted and punished, in addition to the number of victims identified, assisted and sheltered. The aim of the data collection is to provide a systematic global map of the existing data in order to better inform the international community and academia on the extent of human trafficking.

The data collection activity utilizes a set of regional focal points whereby ten researchers have been placed in UNODC regional offices (Mexico City, Brasilia, Dakar and Abuja, Cairo, Nairobi, Pretoria, Tashkent, New Delhi, and Bangkok) to conduct data collection in their regions. In addition, the European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control, affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI), is responsible for collecting data from Europe and North America. The information collected is sent to one central location where data is validated, standardized and compiled into a database.

Human Trafficking Reporting System, Department of Justice, USA

In the United States, the *Trafficking Victims Protection Act* of 2005 requires biennial reporting on human trafficking. In response to this requirement, the Department of Justice funded the creation of the Human Trafficking Reporting System (HTRS) which was designed by the Institute of Race and Justice at Northeastern University and the Justice Policy Centre at the Urban Institute. The HTRS uses available information from state and local authorities to provide data on human trafficking incidents that have been investigated.

HTRS data represent a snapshot of the investigations opened by 38 federally funded human trafficking task forces. Because the task forces were not selected to be statistically representative, the data do not represent all incidents of human trafficking in the United States. Details about each investigation are entered through an online data portal and include incidents, suspects, victims identified and investigated by the respective task force. An investigation is defined as any effort in which the task force spent at least one hour investigating an incident. Each incident is uniquely identified. Task forces began entering retrospective information on all human trafficking investigations in January 2008. Once entered into the system, an incident may or may not be confirmed as involving human trafficking. *http://www.humantrafficking.neu.edu*

Romanian Database on Trafficking in Human beings

The Romanian Database on Trafficking in Human Beings, developed by the National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (ANITP), has been operational since January 2007. This centralized national database enables law enforcement personnel to input and process information on trafficking victims in order to facilitate the prompt referral to specialized support services. The database facilitates the monitoring of assistance provided to trafficking victims, and provides a better understanding of trends in human trafficking.

The national system is a multilevel IT system, using a central database and a user web interface. Access to the national database is granted to accredited personnel from the General Directorate for Combating Organized Crime within the General Inspectorate of the Romanian Police and the General Inspectorate of Border Police. The information contained in the database can be collected from other partner institutions and NGOs through ANITP Regional Centres.

A set of 70 indicators divided into six categories are collected. The breadth of quantitative and qualitative information collected provides specialists with an ongoing and detailed picture of human trafficking. Based on this information, recommendations can be made regarding prevention and assistance to victims. As a result of the data collected, ANITP was able to identify an increase in labor trafficking of Romanians to the Czech Republic and disseminate the information to law enforcement and policy officials.

Appendix III — Consultation summary

Feasibility Study: Developing a National Data Collection Framework to Measure Trafficking in Persons

Consultation Summary

Background

In recent years, Canada has made some progress in the development of a common understanding of trafficking in persons (TIP) and criminal legislation has been passed to combat TIP. However, similar to other countries worldwide, less progress has been made in assessing the nature and extent of TIP in Canada.

Given the limited amount of national data available on TIP, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Canada (PSEPC) has funded the Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics (CCJS) at Statistics Canada to examine the feasibility of developing a national data collection framework that will address options for measuring TIP in Canada. Reliable information and data is an essential tool that will inform and assist policy makers in the decision-making process on issues of relating to human trafficking.

This feasibility study will undertake consultations with representatives from the Interdepartmental Working Group on Trafficking in Persons (IWGTIP) and other key stakeholders, including government, the police community, non-governmental agencies (NGOs) and academics. The consultation process will be divided into 2 phases.

Consultation: Phase I

The purpose of phase I of the consultation process is to:

1. Clarify and prioritize the objectives of a national data collection framework for trafficking in persons;
2. Clearly define the scope of TIP (sexual exploitation, labour, organs, etc.), the unit of measurement (incident, victim, accused, case), and the level of analysis (domestic versus international; national versus provincial/territorial) to be collected in Canada;
3. Specify your organization's data and information needs regarding TIP in Canada and identify any gaps;
4. Identify the types of data and information that are currently being collected by your department/ organization;
5. Identify potential indicators (both direct and indirect) of human trafficking; and,
6. Identify the challenges faced in data collection and data sharing in a Canadian context.

Upon completion of the first phase of consultations, a second round of consultations will be conducted with only those stakeholders that indicated that their department or organization collects data and/or information about trafficking in persons.

The purpose of phase II of the consultations is to assess, in more detail, the types of TIP data that are currently being collected in more detail. That is:

- how the information is being collected;
- what the information is being used for;
- whether additional information could be collected to address identified data gaps;
- whether departments/organizations are willing to share the information, and;
- what obstacles would need to be overcome so that departments/organizations could share information or collect additional information.

The resulting final feasibility report will summarize the current understanding of human trafficking in Canada, including: current data holdings, data needs and information gaps, and identify possible direct and indirect indicators for TIP. In addition, a discussion concerning the collection of direct and indirect indicators will be included. Also to be highlighted are the challenges that will need to be addressed regarding the collection and sharing of information about human trafficking and recommendations for future direction.

Please consult with colleagues within your respective organizations and respond to the questions as completely as possible. Your participation is important to ensure that we accurately portray the current situation regarding objectives, priorities, data availability, information needs and gaps in our collective knowledge of human trafficking in Canada. We would appreciate receiving your responses no later than **April 30, 2008.**

Identification of consultation participant(s)

Name(s) _____

Organization _____

Section: _____

Email address _____

Phone number (_____)_____-_____

Date of completion: _____

Discussion points

1. Objectives

Developing a national data collection framework to measure the nature and extent of trafficking in persons in Canada can serve a range of objectives.

Table 1
Which of these objectives, if any, are most important to your organization? Why?

Objective	Importance rating				
	From most important (1) to least important (5)				
	1	2	3	4	5
	percent				
To increase public awareness	9	12	24	13	42
To establish baseline information	18	27	15	31	10
To enhance capacity to make evidence-based decisions	27	36	18	16	3
To improve detection and reporting	36	21	21	9	10
To work towards consistent and accurate data collection	9	3	21	31	35

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Are there other objectives that you would like a national TIP data collection framework to address?

- tracking of missing individuals (children) using identification information worldwide
- provide data for research purposes
- establish concrete action
- fulfill reporting obligations to parliament and international organizations
- improve government response (e.g. services for victims)
- help determine penetration of organized crime and facilitate an understanding of the scope of organized crime operations in general and in relation to TIP
- identification and information sharing
- develop prevention strategies and tracking
- increase intelligence information
- identify risk factors that could prevent/reduce TIP
- promoting links between researchers, policy makers and educational institutions
- develop mechanism for tracking demand
- granting/denial of TRP applications
- distinguish trafficking for sexual exploitation and those trafficked for labour
- capture deportation rates of women according to country
- ongoing and consistent monitoring of migrants and refugees

2. Scope of trafficking in persons

According to the *Criminal Code of Canada*,

> *Trafficking in persons involves the recruitment, movement or harbouring of a person by means of deception, coercion or force, in order to exploit that person through various forms of sexual exploitation or forced labour.*
>
> *It is an offence to recruit, transport or deal with persons in any other methods specified for the purpose of exploiting them or facilitating their exploitation. Exploitation is defined broadly and envisages two circumstances. One circumstance is where the victim is forced to provide services or labour because they fear for their safety or the safety of someone they know. The other form of exploitation is using deception or coercion to have an organ or tissue removed.*

Table 2
Should the trafficking in persons data collection framework be focused on collecting information from the following:

	Importance rating (please check one)			
	Essential	Desirable, but not essential	Not important	Don't know/no opinion
	percent			
International trafficking in persons [1]	97	0	3	0
Transit trafficking in persons [2]	70	27	3	0
Domestic trafficking in persons [3]	88	6	3	3
Persons trafficked from Canada [4]	76	18	3	3

1. Those persons moved from one foreign country into Canada where they are then exploited.
2. Trafficked persons that transit through Canada en route to another destination.
3. Persons moved from one location to another within Canada, where they are subsequently exploited.
4. Persons trafficked from Canada to another foreign country.

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Comments

- These are all essential. If we can get data on domestic TIP it will lead to information internationally.
- Difficult to define and measure. Prostitution is difficult to separate out when recruitment is involved, but it needs to be so that the policy solutions and approaches can be targeted.
- The focus should start with information about Canadians transported within Canada and to other countries. Children who are trafficked should be identified as such during data collection.
- Without including all categories of trafficking, the database may miss the most important realities of Canada's role in human trafficking. The precise nature of the problem needs to be assessed.
- To obtain a more accurate picture of the nature and scope of human trafficking in Canada, we will need to look at all possible scenarios (i.e. domestic trafficking as well as Canada as a source /transit/destination country).
- All of these types of trafficked victims are equally important to track. Sometimes one victim may be categorized in more than one of these.
- In many instances, there is a blurring of lines between the recruitment and grooming of young people into the sex trade and the geographic movement of sex trade workers form one location or community to another.
- By establishing credible stats in all of these areas we will better be able to identify the scope of the problem and establish a better working relationship with other countries to both obtain intelligence from them as well as provide intelligence.

- The issue of trafficking is convoluted. In order for the federal government to apply a holistic and comprehensive paradigm to this issue, data on all forms of trafficking needs to be collected, disseminated and collated concurrently and on an on-going basis.
- From a law enforcement and criminal intelligence perspective, it is as valuable to know the extent to which Canadian citizens/residents are facilitating TIP, as it is to know who is sending people to (or through) Canada from abroad.
- Links need to be made between domestic and international types of trafficking. By focusing only on international side, it is easy for Canadians to not accept that it is happening here, that Canadians themselves are being victimized and recruited into trafficking.
- The data collection framework should also include data on Aboriginal people (boys, girls, women and men).
- Pleased that the amendments to the *Criminal Code* did not distinguish between domestic and international trafficking. It is essential to monitor all known cases of movement into, through, within and from Canada.
- If a data collection framework is to be established, it must be informed by a view of TIP that includes all of its dimensions, including the international, domestic, and in-transit contexts. Appropriate parameters around a data collection framework can facilitate the development of analysis for trends and typologies associated with this area of criminal activity.

Table 3
While the known trafficking in persons cases in Canada have predominantly involved forms of sexual exploitation, which of the following types of trafficking are important to capture when collecting national data?

Type of trafficking in persons case	Importance rating (please check one)			
	Essential	Desirable, but not essential	Not important	Don't know/ no opinion
	percent			
Sexual exploitation	100	0	0	0
Forced labour	78	22	0	0
Human organs and tissue	62	26	6	6
Forced begging	32	39	3	26
Foreign adoption	45	33	3	18
Mail-order brides	56	25	3	16
Child sex tourism	82	15	0	3
Foreign caregivers	53	31	3	13
Migrant smuggling	66	22	0	13

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Other suggestions included:

- Domestic workers
- Missing persons
- Organized crime
- S. 34-42 of *IRPA*
- Bawdy houses
- Fishing industry workers
- Agricultural workers

- Missing Aboriginal people
- Exotic services/dancing
- Natural Resource extraction
- Construction and labour
- Massage
- Human smuggling for the purposes of facilitating the movement of members of a terrorist group

Comments

- We recognize the importance of all above issues; however, from a health perspective, human organs/tissues, sexual exploitation, child sex tourism, foreign caregivers are also important.
- We will need a solid operational definition of 'human trafficking' so as to distinguish it from smuggling.
- It is important to ensure that data is clearly disaggregated by type of work undertaken.
- Too early/arbitrary to focus only on one type of exploitation and eliminate data collection on others. It is important to gather data on all forms of trafficking in Canada to provide law enforcement authorities and partners with a clear picture of the scope and type of TIP.
- Information on any/all of these aspects of TIP would be useful if linked to proceeds of crime and/or the potential laundering of these proceeds.
- TIP and human smuggling should be differentiated and those differences need to be accurately reflected in the numbers and in context pieces.
- Although women and children are the primary victims, it is essential that all forms of trafficking be identified and responded to.
- Not all activities listed above constitute TIP.
- It is important to emphasize that forced labour may involve workers who are either adults or children (e.g., 'rest avec').

Table 4
According to your organization, at which point is a person considered to be a 'victim' or 'survivor' of human trafficking?

Defining victims	Please check one		
	Yes	No	Don't know
	percent		
Individuals who self-identify	69	14	17
Suspected but not confirmed	43	21	36
Identified by the authorities	89	0	11
Identified and confirmed by the authorities	97	0	3
Trafficking in persons victims receiving services	83	10	7
Trafficking in persons victims that declined services	67	7	26

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Other suggestions included:

- Self-identified and currently confirmed
- S. 34-42 of *IRPA*
- Identified by an NGO
- More than one category response

How does your organization define a victim of human trafficking?

12 respondents indicated *Criminal Code* alone, *Criminal Code* and *IRPA* (34%)
9 respondents -own definition of TIP (26%)
7 respondents -UN Protocol (20%)
1 respondent -*Criminal Code*, *IRPA* and UN Protocol
1 respondent -no definition
5 respondents did not respond to this question (14%)

Below are examples of the definitions provided by those respondents indicating that they had a definition for a victim of human trafficking:

- An identified complainant with credible information, substantiated or not, they will be considered a victim until investigation proves otherwise.
- Self define in current situation of exploitation or coercion; individual with historical circumstances that are a little higher benchmark than self identified are able to articulate why if self identified.
- Person or child who suffers from harm from the conduct of others, against his will or consent (with or without his knowledge) or is tortured, assaulted or forced to do tasks or functions against his will.
- An individual who is subjected to labour or sexual exploitation is a victim of human trafficking.
- The organization's role is not to identify victims but rather to work with the victims, as witnesses, in order to mount an effective human trafficking prosecution.
- Anyone who is exploited for profit or material benefit, by threats or coercion.
- Someone who is coerced into exploitative labour for the profit of another.
- In the same way as Antonio Maria Costa does: Human Trafficking, is a form of "Slavery that is a booming international trade, less obvious than two hundred years ago for sure, but all around us. Perhaps we simply prefer to close our eyes to it, as many law-abiding citizens buy the products and the services produced on the cheap by slaves". It is a practice that involves taking people away from their home communities –often across borders- national and international, in order to control and exploit them.
- If she is faced with violence or homelessness, should she refuse to move to a different place with her 'boyfriend'. If she has been forced onto a plane, car, truck or bus otherwise she will be beaten or other forms of threats.

Table 5
Should data on human trafficking be collected only at the Canada level, or also at the provincial/territorial levels, by census metropolitan area?

Level of geography	Importance rating (please check one)			
	Essential	Desirable, but not essential	Not important	Don't know/ no opinion
	percent			
Canada	97	3	0	0
Province/territory	91	6	3	0
Census metropolitan area (i.e., Vancouver, Toronto, Montréal)	88	9	3	0

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Other?

- Police services
- External geographic data
- Aboriginal communities
- Rural/urban
- By NGO
- Consulates/overseas posts
- Smaller municipal centres
- Academic communities

Comments

- TIP may begin within a province and grow from there. Early identification/detection can help.
- Geographic data is essential in assessing the nature of the problem. This must include city level granularity when possible as these are the ports of entry to the country and will provide key data.
- For many reasons it will be important to drill-down as far as possible e.g. CMA level.
- From a labour perspective, it would be important to disaggregate data according to location to target areas, departments or programs which are susceptible to incidences of trafficking for forced labour.
- The data would have to be gathered from a number of different sources (local/municipal/ provincial and national) to get the most accurate picture so it makes sense to capture all.
- Detailed statistics are essential.
- Intelligence needs to be shared within Canada. Identify target locations for traffickers for recruitment as well as areas of exploitation.
- It is very important to adopt an extensive data collection program which could be monitored and supervised by the federal government. By so doing, data quality and reliability can improve, consistency can be ensured and duplication can be reduced.

- Any strategy aimed at data collection on TIP must remain seized of the reality that Canada's major urban centres are the largest recipients of new immigrants, and are likely also the parts of the country where TIP is most likely to occur. Organized crime is likely to be a larger consideration in major urban centres, and one might suspect that TIP would also be a larger problem in those centres, making them logical starting points for data collection.
- Need data collection at all levels so we can be aware of what is happening and provide services to those who have been trafficked. Also we can look at the factors locally (or provincially) that are contributing to the demand for cheap and exploitable labour.
- CMA is important because most of the trafficked people are located in the most important cities. Data should be collected at all levels. Due to the clandestine nature of trafficking, it will be difficult for STC to assume this responsibility (Academic).
- Any and all data collected would be subjective and accuracy would be an issue due to the covert nature of this criminal activity and the ongoing lack of cooperation of victims.
- It is necessary to have national and provincial/territorial information to track patterns of trafficking in Canada and to share information among the diverse regions.
- Obtain complete picture as possible info/stats are necessary from all levels. Essential to incorporate preventive measures that include out of the country efforts such as consulates, liaison officers, etc. At source interventions have positive effect.
- It would assist in determining where to place TIP resources if we knew the location of the highest incidents of TIP in Canada. It would also be invaluable to know source and transit countries.
- For the purposes of the federal government, a breakdown of trafficking in persons by province or major metropolitan region is not essential to our ability to report on the scale of the problem at national, regional or international fora.

3. Information needs: Direct indicators

The purpose of this section is to determine what kinds of TIP data and information are required to meet the needs of your organization. Please note that this is not intended to be a detailed needs assessment exercise, but rather to provide a general overview of the type of information that is required.

Table 6
Which of the following types of trafficking in persons information do you regard as important to meet your organization's needs?

Information needs	Importance rating (please check one)			
	Essential	Desirable, but not essential	Not important	Don't know/ no opinion
	percent			
Number of trafficking in persons incidents (or cases)	82	18	0	0
Number of suspected and confirmed incidents (cases)	76	17		7
Number of trafficking in persons victims	94	6	0	0
Number of persons accused of trafficking in persons	73	23	0	3
Type(s) of exploitation (sexual exploitation, forced labour, etc.)	94	6	0	0
Victim characteristics (sex, age, injury)	84	13	3	0
Citizenship of trafficking in persons victims	71	26	3	0
Accused characteristics (sex, age)	63	28	6	3
Characteristics of the incident/case (date, location, charges laid)	61	25	7	7
Number of international and domestic trafficking in persons incidents	87	13	0	0
Number of trafficking in persons incidents that were attributed to organized crime	68	23	3	6
Profits generated through trafficking in persons	43	43	13	0
Total number of prosecutions	77	19	0	3
Total number of convictions	78	19	0	3
Type of dispositions	53	38	0	9
Sentence length	53	41	3	3
Number of Temporary Resident Permits issued	66	24	0	10
Number of trafficking in persons victims that received services	58	26	10	6
Types of services received	50	36	7	7
Impacts/consequences of trafficking in persons on victims	47	38	13	3
Number of repatriated trafficking in persons victims and number remaining in Canada	54	39	4	4
Number of trafficking in persons victims that were re-trafficked	59	38	0	3

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Other direct indicators:

- Number of victims with health diseases.
- Number TIP victims not identified by the authorities.
- Number of victims/accused by industry.
- Cases where assistance was rendered.
- Forced marriages.
- Victim ethnicity.
- Relationship between the accused and the victim.
- Language spoken by victim.
- Citizenship of accused.
- Number victims wanting to stay in Canada but cannot.

What specific questions would your organization like answered concerning trafficking in persons?

General TIP questions:

- The real number of human trafficked persons in Canada – Is it a problem or not?
- What is Canada's role in trafficking?
- What is the nature of trafficking involving Canada?
- Require baseline information on the incidence of TIP in Canada.
- All and any information listed in the Table 6 with as much detail as possible.
- Which countries are more likely to undertake this practice within Canada?
- What is the nature/scope of TIP in Canada (domestic and International cases) at the national, provincial/ territorial and CMA levels?
- What are the top forms of human trafficking in Canada?
- What is the connection between migration and human trafficking in Canada?
- How might women migrate more safely and not fall into the hands of traffickers?
- The extent of TIP in Canada and more specifically the distinction between international trafficking.
- Type of trafficking (sexual exploitation, forced labour).
- What is the scope of the problem of international and domestic trafficking in the municipal area of Ottawa? In the province of Ontario? How does the problem in Ottawa compare to other Canadian cities of similar size?
- Specific trend data applicable to this region.
- Point of first contact with the TIP victim. Victim identified at port of entry, during police raid.

Victim characteristics

- Who are the victims of trafficking involving Canada? What is the profile of a typical victim of TIP? Who are the players, location of victims?
- How human trafficking victims are identified.
- Families, children, citizenship of the children.
- How many children are victims of TIP? What are the motives?
- Is there any information that a victim did not know that, had he/she known it, would have helped prevent human trafficking?
- Data on TIP victims that are Aboriginal, i.e. characteristics, frequency of trafficking, etc.
- What are the keys to identifying potential victims of trafficking?
- How many women are being trafficked for purposes of sexual exploitation (porn films, prostituted, etc)?
- Why did the victim end up being trafficked? What were the circumstances that led to it?

Accused characteristics

- What is the profile of a typical offender/suspect?
- How to obtain information on traffickers?
- Information about the Aboriginal status of trafficked persons and those accused of such offences.

Responses to TIP

- What programs exist to examine the underlying cultural, social and economic issues that lead to TIP?
- Information pertaining to victims in the criminal justice system primarily from a victim support perspective. Information related to other criminal justice stakeholders would be relevant as well.
- How does Justice view domestic TIP in relation to international TIP and the prosecution of domestic cases?
- What is being done by other enforcement agencies to gain compliance of suspected and confirmed victims?
- What is being done by other agencies to successfully detect and detour this criminal behaviour?
- Techniques that lead to successful prosecution or interventions?
- What is being done to address the gendered nature of the problem in terms of consequences, such as health?
- What conditions, if any, are attached to sentences received by offenders?

Victim services

- The types of services that TIP victims require and the types of services they can access.
- What types of services do victims say they need but did not receive? Does this vary by jurisdiction?
- What do victims consider essential services?
- Who is responsible for them? Do adoptive parents lose their parental authority?
- Is the child eligible for adoption by others afterwards?
- What does government see as the NGO/non-profit specific roles for assisting in initiatives against human trafficking?
- What services are offered to adopted children following sentencing of the accused?

Organized crime involvement

- Need to confirm the involvement of organized crime in human trafficking.
- What type of organized crime groups are involved in TIP in Canada?
- Questions relating to the traffickers, how TIP fits into the "business model" of organized crime, how money associated with TIP is used, how TIP-related money is placed, layered, and integrated within the formal/informal financial system, domestically and internationally.

Demand side

- How does the robust local sex industry in Vancouver contribute to sex trafficking both internationally and domestically?

- How many licensed massage parlours are in Canada? What is the nationality of the business owners?
- Which conglomerates or corporations have invested in massage parlours?
- How is the demand for cheap, exploitable labour in Canada tied to human trafficking?
- How many massage parlours are owned by the same person(s)?
- Does the unique nature of Ottawa as the national capital affect the scope/means of international trafficking?
- Does focus on the technology sector in Ottawa affect the scope or means of international trafficking in municipalities?

National database

- Who or what organizations will be entitled to access the data?
- Whose responsibility will it be to maintain and manage the database?
- Who will be offering training for usage of the database, how and to whom?
- What measures would be put in place to ensure the ethical standards of the database?
- How might the information collected be used for public awareness and education?

What are the gaps in data or information on human trafficking that need to be addressed?

Lack of information

- The real number of human trafficked persons in Canada. Is it a problem or not?
- No comprehensive collection of data on trafficking in Canada.
- In Canada, little, if any, data is presently being systematically collected and disseminated.
- No one is responsible for collecting this data, important to consider putting this into place.
- RCMP data is unavailable most of the time, files are classified.
- All of the above are gaps since we have virtually no data.
- Unfamiliar with anything approaching a workable common understanding of trafficking.
- The very clandestine nature of the offence is exactly what makes it so difficult to address.
- The major gap has always been the lack of base rate information.
- Very little data exists, and question reliability of what does exist.
- There is not a system in place to measure the number of TIP investigations, prosecutions and convictions.
- Suggest a Human trafficking check-off box incorporated into the *Criminal Code* offences - in place of human trafficking legislation.
- Most current information is international in nature. Useful Canadian statistics are virtually non-existent.
- The failure to understand the nature of sexual exploitation and considering it only at its worst.
- Information on migrant farm workers, mail order brides.

- How many people are trafficked in order to resolve gambling debts?

Communication

- Lack of information sharing, because this is an international problem communication is essential.
- Gap in terms of provincial/territorial relationships with the federal working group and information sharing.
- Relationships between government and NGOs are usually inadequate by the lack of reciprocal communication.
- Does there exist, or is there support for a tri-partite governmental working group?
- Information sharing on provincial/municipal initiatives to combat human trafficking and raise awareness.

Victim data

- Better information on victims of trafficking, source regions, destinations and links with organized crime.
- Need to know what type(s) of exploitation is occurring- forced labour, sexual exploitation.
- TIP statistical data in relation to Aboriginal people in Canada.
- What the opening of casinos in every township added to the numbers of women being trafficked out of Canada.
- Focusing on young women being trafficked and failing to see how many older women are disguised as being much younger.
- Collect data on what happens to those sent back. What are the consequences to the individual?
- What happens when potential TIP victims are discovered at the border?

Organized crime

- Questions relating to the traffickers, how TIP fits into the 'business model' of organized crime.
- How money associated with TIP is used.
- How TIP-related money is placed internationally.

Temporary Resident Permits (TRP)

- The number of victims that are not eligible for TRP's and are therefore not reflected in CIC statistics as victims of trafficking.
- Lack of TRP statistics
- Why is the burden of proof (to obtain a TRP) on the woman to prove she was trafficked?

Responses to TIP

- What is being done to address the gendered nature of the problem in terms of consequences, such as health?
- Services that are available to victims in each of the provinces and territories should be outlined.
- More education regarding criminal charges and powers of immigration for front-line workers.
- How many of the charges laid are TIP-related offences e.g. extortion, uttering threats, assault.
- Improved monitoring for improved administrative decision-making among various organizations.

- What programs exist to examine the underlying cultural, social and economic situation that lead to TIP?
- Creating more visible education and awareness link to the Vancouver 2010 Olympics and general public safety net.
- Lack of a governmental framework in relation to victims' protection.
- The federal government has not yet officially established an office/unit to deal specifically with human trafficking.
- Expansion of the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act* to include not only 'immigrants and refugees' but everyone.
- Enforcement of the *IRPA* and Bill C-49 of the *CC* to include more stringent penalties.
- Information which facilitates identification of a person as described in s34-42 of *IRPA*.
- Flexibility in relations to victim's protection issues that is applied in a case-by-case procedures.
- NGOs are under-financed and fearful of providing the scarce information they have.

National database

- Data is scattered across multiple organizations with neither collection standards nor any data sharing mechanisms.
- Data may not be recognized as related to trafficking by various organizations.
- Having stakeholders submit and subsequently retrieve the information would be ideal.
- We need a centralized process in consultation with all governments to obtain more accurate information.
- The gaps in information lie in a coherent data set on victims, offences, incidents, etc.
- There are very few cases identified, so it is very difficult to come up with statistics that are credible.
- Different agencies use different definitions to define human trafficking.
- Need a centralized process that would allow CBSA and partner agencies to collect intelligence on human trafficking.
- Develop a mechanism in police reporting similar to that used in the context of gang-related murders.

4. Data holdings

Part of this study is to examine current data holdings to determine and assess the capacity to respond to the information needs identified through this consultation process. Therefore, we are asking a series of questions to better understand what types of data currently exist, and identify any gaps in the information.

Table 7
Does your organization collect and maintain data or information that is relevant to trafficking in persons?

	Please check one		
	Yes	No	Don't know
	percent		
Collect data and/or information on trafficking in persons	56	29	15

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Agencies that indicated whether or not they collect information on trafficking in persons

(a) Elizabeth Fry Society, Greater Vancouver Area
Don't know — We are trying to collect it systematically in our programs rather than haphazardly. Information on number of women held on immigration, women who self identify, who enter into shelters, or are repatriated to Canada.

(b) Vancouver Police, Vice Unit
Yes — Collect data through police files - living off the avails of prostitution, keeping a common bawdy house.

(c) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, National Missing Children Services
Yes — National Missing Children Services closely monitors its missing children cases for indications of domestic and international trafficking of children.

(d) University of British Columbia, Faculty of Law
Yes — Collect information on source, destination, transit. Demand for sex tourism involving Canadians.

(e) Intercountry Adoption Services, Community Development and Partnerships Directorate
Yes — Collects information from embassies regarding situations in certain countries where we suspect the falsification of documents, different versions regarding the origin of children in orphanages, the trafficking of children, etc.

(f) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, National Crime Prevention Services Branch
Yes — Royal Canadian Mounted Police's Police Reporting and Occurrence System.

(g) Alberta Solicitor General and Public Security, Victim Services Branch
Don't know — Our office compiles the statistics sent to us from our funded victim service programs.

(h) Public Prosecution Service of Canada, Headquarters Counsel Group
Yes — Collects the number of trafficking in persons cases prosecuted by Public Prosecution Service of Canada.

(i) Saskatchewan Ministry of Justice and Attorney General, Policy, Planning and Evaluation Branch
Don't know — Data on domestic prostitution-related incidents that come to the attention of police. No human trafficking.

(j) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Human Trafficking National Coordination Center
Yes — Our organization collects data on all investigations on human trafficking. Names and personal information on all alleged victims, suspects and witnesses. Details of the allegation including location of the offence, location of where victim was recruited from, other offences that may be associated with the offence.

(k) Citizenship and Immigration Canada
Yes — Region and office dealing with the case. Was Temporary Resident Permit issued, if yes, date and duration, is this a subsequent permit? Client ID, number, minor, country of citizenship, work permit issued. Third party involvement, gender, summary of the case and Temporary Resident Permit decision. Information is populated manually after receiving information from officers processing cases in the field.

(l) Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons, British Columbia
Yes — Collect information on demographics, forms of trafficking (labour, organ, sexual exploitation, etc.), movement type (transition, destination), state of physical and mental health. Job variation and kind. Legal, law enforcement and immigration, passport, deportation, Temporary Resident Permit, housing. Using information for research, education and awareness. Referral system, other forms of support.

(m) Human Resources and Skills Development Canada, Social Program Analysis Division
No response — No response

(n) The Salvation Army, Anti-Human Trafficking Network
Yes — We do not have a national database for those encountered that are trafficking in persons cases; there would be record of such, identified as trafficking in persons cases through the Salvation Army center that assisted.

(o) Financial Transactions Reports Analysis Centre of Canada
Yes — Collect data via Section 54 of the *Proceeds of Crime* (money laundering) and *Terrorist Financing Act*.

(p) Resist Exploitation, Embrace Dignity
Yes — We keep confidential case histories on all of the women we serve or come into contact with.

(q) Université de Montréal, Interdisciplinary Research Centre on Family Violence and Violence against Women; École de service social
Yes — Université de Montréal is interested in research. I do have data related to qualitative information.

(r) Changing Together - A Centre for Immigrant Women
Yes — Environmental Scan identifying who in Alberta has seen victims of human trafficking.

(s) Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Human Trafficking Awareness Coordinator "O" Division
Yes — Official statistics are collected when the files are scored as human trafficking. The Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre keeps detailed records of all trafficking in persons cases brought to their attention.

(t) Canada Border Services Agency, Anti-Fraud and Human Trafficking
Yes — Collect intelligence and compile intelligence reports on suspected human smuggling and potential trafficking victims. Collect/compile intelligence on trafficking cases and potential smugglers and traffickers. Collect intelligence on the circumstances which lead us to believe that trafficking is taking place.

(u) Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade, International Crime and Terrorism Division
Yes — Collect information for the purpose of responding to international questionnaires (e.g. United Nations and United States Trafficking in Persons report).

(v) Justice Canada, Criminal Law Police Section
Yes — Review of reported & unreported court decisions & information provided directly by law enforcement.

(w) Statistics Canada, Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics
Yes — Official police-reported data. Court data. Corrections data.

(x) Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking Humans, Carleton University
Yes — Anecdotal evidence about trafficked persons encountered by service providers in Ottawa, and about trafficked persons encountered by law enforcement in Ottawa. Number of participants at information seminars and workshops provided by Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking Humans members.

If yes, can you describe the type(s) of information your organization collects? Please attach any documentation that would describe the types of information that is collected.

5. Indirect indicators

The extent of human trafficking can be measured in a number of ways. One means is through the collection of direct indicators (e.g., number of TIP incidents, victims, accused, etc); alternatively, researchers have pointed to the use of indirect indicators as possible measures of human trafficking.

Table 8
Which of the following indicators do you feel may be potential indirect measures for human trafficking in Canada?

Indirec tindicators	Degree of relevance (please check one)		
	Relevant	Not relevant	Don't know/ no opinion
	percent		
Number of illegal border crossings	71	14	14
Number of smuggled migrants	77	10	13
Number of missing Aboriginal women, girls	86	3	10
Number of missing women	83	3	14
Number of missing children	83	0	17
Number of foreign caregivers/domestic workers	59	11	30
Number of kidnappings, abductions, forcible confinement	69	7	24
Incidents of child pornography	82	4	14
Number of child pornography/child modeling websites that were shut down	57	14	29
Number of illegal adoptions	66	7	28
Number of migrant workers entering/leaving Canada	50	14	36
Number of Temporary Resident Permits issued	69	10	21
Number of labour code violations	57	10	33

Note(s): Percentages may not add up to 100% due to rounding.

Are there other indirect indicators for human trafficking that your organization could suggest?

- Caveats and limitations around 'indirect' and direct indicators must be clearly spelled out.
- Get more facts related to each TIP case to verify if it is TIP-related, whether there is a link.
- Beneficial to take a closer look at these indicators before weeding out non-trafficked persons.
- Multiple indicators, some are more significant than others.

Demand side

- Monitoring the demand for purchased sex.
- Number of women who have entered Canada on the 'stripper visa' since its inception.
- The existence of a robust sex industry is also an indicator.
- Number of hidden or unlicensed escort services, brothels, or bawdy houses.
- Number of escorts and their ethnicity advertised on web sites and newspapers.

- Number of foreign brides, spousal visas issued.
- The fact that the age of consent is so low contributes to sex tourism.

Other

- Cases of Internet luring or attempts.
- Number of immigration holds and denied TIP allegations by detained individuals. Immigration and border statistics. Numbers held at airports on holds versus in prison cells. Number of foreign nationals held in immigration detention because they haven't satisfied authorities of their identity, or because they are considered a flight risk.
- Numbers of unaccompanied minors, especially young girls aged 16 to 19.
- When collecting data on domestic TIP, should be focused on vulnerable populations e.g. First Nations.
- Other *Criminal Code* offences related to TIP including sexual assaults, uttering threats, extortion, etc.
- Size and penetration of organized crime in country of origin of trafficking victims.
- Number of lost and/or stolen passports in Canada and abroad.
- Vulnerability factors i.e.: addictions and substance abuse, history of domestic violence, etc.
- Number of persons found in vicinity of border whom authorities suspect of planning an illegal border crossing.
- Gang-related crimes.
- Data on illicit drugs and weapon trade.

6. Challenges

What difficulties do you foresee in trying to collect accurate national data on TIP?

Common themes raised include:

Data comparability

- Organizations not using same definition of human trafficking.
- Clear definitions.
- Verifiable information from victims and lack of truthful information from the accused.
- Confusion regarding the overlap between TIP, migration and labour issues.
- Consolidating data from multiple sources while avoiding duplication.
- Assessing the reliability of data.
- Designing a system that can capture all the relevant relationships between cases and elements within cases.
- Maintaining a database and its related barriers to data sharing.
- Confusion between human trafficking and smuggling.
- Establishing a joint force to ensure constant and quick information sharing.

- Obtaining good contacts.
- Even though a child is missing, there may/ or may not be a link to trafficking.
- It is difficult to agree on what constitutes a TIP victim.
- Different collection methods used across organizations.
- Is it possible to use a similar organization (i.e. victim service) which is in every province as your main data source?
- Huge definitional and operational hurdles.
- Variety of definitions regarding what is or is not trafficking.
- Confusion of the definition of TIP will also be a barrier.
- Lack of a widely shared common understanding of the basic features of human trafficking.
- Developing a database that is user friendly.
- Maintaining consistencies across the board.
- Finding a systematic way of collecting data across departments, agencies, federally and provincially.
- Duplicate information.
- Ensure common definitions and understanding of terms.
- Data management, training and education.
- It is going to be difficult to determine the ongoing status of a victim during an investigation.
- Data may be collected in different jurisdictions (feds, prov/terr, civil society) over different time periods. Different jurisdictions may have differing definitions.
- May not all collect the same type of data and may have different resource levels to undertake collection.
- Identifying a TIP victim.
- Obtaining accurate data on Aboriginal people.
- Trafficked persons be given a numeric identifier in order to maintain anonymity.
- Ensure that victims are not double-counted.
- Using data for research and policy reforms.
- Confidentiality, privacy and other ethical concerns.
- Lack of reporting and detecting TIP is also a significant impediment.
- Charges against traffickers are difficult to gather since they are not input into a single database.
- Charges laid related to prostitution offences, even in the event that human trafficking occurs.

Under-reporting

- Willingness of trafficked persons to come forward, (mistrust, language and other cultural barriers) the nature of the exploitation (i.e. the vulnerability of the victim, confinement, mobility problems, etc.).
- According to some research, human trafficking is an underreported crime.
- TIP awareness needs to be raised.
- Victims who are not recorded as such due to their stream of immigration application.
- Forbidden nature of TIP and victims' difficulty to disclose information hinders data collection.
- Fear of retaliation for victims and their families is also an obstacle.
- Consideration to the accuracy would be reluctance of victims to cooperate with support and enforcement.
- Persons are fearful of coming forward or don't perceive themselves as victims.
- Reluctance of NGOs to provide data sometimes related to fear or threats/actions by traffickers.
- Information will inherently be incomplete and somewhat inaccurate due to its immeasurable behaviour.
- Public needs to be better informed about protection mechanisms in place for trafficking victims.
- Much of trafficking is clandestine, it is hard to find solid statistics.
- Awareness of human trafficking needs to be overcome to collect accurate national data on TIP.
- No universal protocol to record local statistics.
- Education of law enforcement and non-law enforcement agencies to accurately score the data.
- Education of all involved to recognize a human trafficking case and respond appropriately.
- Lack of consistency in reporting and defining.

Cooperation

- Federal/provincial cooperation.
- NGOs are not required to disclose the names of the people to whom they are providing services.
- That NGOs are often receiving government money based on the service they provide.
- Prioritization of TIP among other issues that need to be addressed.
- May also place different priority on the issue.

What difficulties do you foresee in trying to share and compile data from across many departments and organizations by a centralized agency?

Confidentiality of information

- Privacy legislation constraints.
- May not be able to share intelligence information.
- Standardization and privacy issues are significant concerns.

- Privacy concerns in possible data matching, cross-tabulation.
- Trying to get data from municipal and provincial/territorial levels.
- Questions about intelligence sharing and audiences.
- Confidentiality and also a lack of trust.
- Difficulties should be solved through creation of a climate of confidence, reliability in government.
- The collection of data would need to be conducted by a trusted source for all involved.
- Departments and organizations not wanting to share the information for various reasons.
- Maintaining a database and its related barriers to data sharing.
- Privacy issues and information sharing barriers.
- Privacy and confidentiality.
- Data collection would need to be presented in aggregate form to protect the privacy of victims.

Definitional differences

- The variances in data collection, characteristics may vary.
- Different wording for the same indicators –lack of consistency amongst organizations and departments.
- Immigration and border control are laws onto themselves but have important data.
- The GOC uses various methods and systems for collecting data.
- Difficulties in trying to collect data at the provincial level.
- Lack of compatibility of data sets across jurisdictions.
- Multiple bodies of support and enforcement groups compiling data cause accuracy and reliability issues.
- Standards for ongoing data collection required. These standards would ensure a level of accuracy.
- The actual definition of human trafficking would have to be identified and adopted by all people involved.
- Different understandings amongst staff regarding indirect versus direct indicators of TIP.
- Agencies and departments may employ different definitions of TIP or may identify victims differently. Issue of double-counting will also have to be addressed.
- Possible double-counting of victims which could skew national level data.

Data management

- Collecting large amounts of data from diverse sources will be difficult to do by a single group.
- The use of different software or data programs to manage the information.
- Theoretically, there shouldn't be any difficulties. Should be the same process as is in place for the gathering of crime statistics in Canada (UCR2).

- The GOC and CBSA have no specific system for collecting data in a centralized manner.
- Different software and data collection systems. There is a need for a harmonized approach.
- Difficult to ensure a follow-up on cases since charges can be laid either on *IRPA* or *CC*.

Conflicting data needs/priorities

- Conflicting needs related to the statistical information between different organizations with different mandates.
- Money and mandate.
- Agencies overload of work and lack of funding.
- Political required to get this done.
- Financial resources.
- Availability of human and other resources and support for necessary training, software and other tools.
- Jurisdictional issues (F/P/T).
- Different interests across departments.

7. Additional stakeholders

Other than the groups listed in this e-mail, can you suggest any other stakeholders the CCJS should be including in this consultation process?

8. Any other comments or suggestions

Have any issues been overlooked? If yes, can you suggest how we can respond to these issues?

Definitional issues

- Need to clarify the definitions (e.g. TIP, human smuggling, prostitution, forcible confinement).
- It is utterly important that any statistics released are credible and verifiable.
- Media also want statistics in order to give credibility to their story.
- A holistic approach to collecting data by including not only legal/criminal aspects but health implications.

Data management

- Once the initial data collection is finished how will the data be kept up to date?
- If collection involves outside sources or organizations how will these organizations update or make corrections?
- Will raw case data be visible or only aggregate data?
- What restrictions on the reuse of data should be made, if any?

Other

- The involvement of organized crime in TIP would be an issue that we would like to learn more about.
- Do judges, legal officers, police officers and custom and immigration officers have the adequate training and necessary information to take action?

- OCTIP would very much like to be actively involved in the development of this national data on human trafficking.
- Congratulations for taking action!
- Types of services that are available and provided for victims of TIP.
- Great idea to conduct a simple one-page survey with all transition houses.

Contact information

Thank you very much for taking the time to complete this consultation document. You may be contacted again to clarify or expand on responses provided.